

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION

+ + + + +

COMMUNICATIONS EQUITY AND DIVERSITY COUNCIL

+ + + + +

MEETING

+ + + + +

THURSDAY
JUNE 15, 2023

+ + + + +

The Council met at FCC Headquarters,
45 L Street, NE, Washington, DC, and via
videoconference, at 10:00 a.m., Heather Gate,
Chair, presiding.

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:
JESSICA ROSENWORCEL, Chair
BRENDAN CARR, Commissioner
NATHAN SIMINGTON, Commissioner

COUNCIL MEMBERS PRESENT:

HEATHER GATE, Chair; Connected Nation
 NICOL TURNER LEE, Ph.D., Vice Chair; Brookings
 Institution
 SUSAN AU ALLEN, Vice Chair; U.S. Pan Asian
 American Chamber of Commerce Education
 Foundation
 RAUL ALARCON, Spanish Broadcasting System
 CHRISTOPHER ALI, Pennsylvania State University
 JENNA ALSAYEGH, USTelecom
 CLAYTON BANKS, Silicon Harlem
 MATTHEW BAUER, Wireless Research Center
 FAITH BAUTISTA, National Diversity Coalition
 ROBERT BRANSON, Multicultural Media, Telecom and
 Internet Council
 ROBERT BROOKS, WHUR-FM, Howard University
 EDGAR CLASS, Wiley Rein LLP
 MICHELE COBER, Verizon
 MELODY SPANN COOPER, Midway Broadcasting
 Corporation
 SUSAN CORBETT, National Digital Equity Center
 BRIGITTE DANIEL-CORBIN, Wilco Electronic Systems
 GRAHAM "SKIP" DILLARD, Audacy New York, 94.7
 WXBK-FM
 JON GANT, North Carolina Central University
 REBECCA GIBBONS, Office for Community Technology,
 City of Portland, Oregon
 ANISA GREEN, AT&T
 CHARLES HARRELL II, The Information Technology
 Architect Corporation
 DOMINIQUE HARRISON, Ph.D., Joint Center for
 Political and Economic Studies
 HOOMAN HEDAYATI, Communication Workers of America
 DAVID HONIG, JulGlo Productions, LLC
 JILL HOUGHTON, Disability:IN
 JENNIFER JACKSON, Stellar TV and Central City
 Productions
 CHRIS JAMES, National Center for American Indian
 Enterprise Development
 RONALD JOHNSON, Wireless Infrastructure
 Association
 SHERMAN KIZART, Kizart Media Partners
 LETICIA LATINO-VAN SPLUNTEREN, Neptuno USA

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
 1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

NICOLAINE LAZARRE, Charter Communications
EVE LEWIS, City of Coconut Creek, Florida
DIANNE LYNCH, PhD, Stephens College
ROSA MENDOZA, ALLvanza
AAMA NAHUJA, A Wonder Media Company
OTTO PADRON, Meruelo Media
LOUIS PERAERTZ, Wireless Internet Service
Provider Association
HENRY RIVERA, Emma Bowen Foundation
STEVEN ROBERTS, The Roberts Companies
VICKIE ROBINSON, Microsoft Airband Initiative
BRIAN SCARPELLI, ACT/The App Association
CHARLYN STANBERRY, National Association of
Broadcasters
ALICIA TAMBE, Meta
JOYCELYN TATE, Black Women's Roundtable, National
Coalition on Black Civic Participation
MONA THOMPSON, Cheyenne River Sioux Tribe
Telephone Authority
ANTONIO TIJERINO, Hispanic Heritage Foundation
ANTONIO WILLIAMS, Comcast
CHRISTOPHER WOOD, LGBT Technology Partnership &
Institute

COMMISSION STAFF:
JAMILA BESS JOHNSON, Designated Federal Officer;
Media Bureau
DIANA COHO, Consumer Affairs and Outreach
Specialist;
Consumer and Government Affairs Bureau
HOLLY SAURER, Chief; Media Bureau

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

CONTENTS

| | | |
|---|-----|----|
| Welcome and Opening of Meeting Holly Saurer . . . | 6 | |
| Welcome Remarks | | |
| Brendan Carr | 8 | |
| Geoffrey Starks | 13 | |
| Nathan Simington | 17 | |
| Jamila Bess Johnson | 22 | |
| Diana Coho | 23 | |
| Jessica Rosenworcel | 44 | |
| CEDC Chair/Vice Chairs' Opening Remarks | | |
| Heather Gate | 24 | |
| Dr. Nicol Turner Lee | 34 | |
| Susan Au Allen | 52 | |
| Call to Order of the June 15, 2023 CEDC Meeting/Roll Call of CEDC Members | | 58 |
| Innovation and Access Working Group Report | | |
| Robert Brooks | 66 | |
| Jennifer J. Jackson | 76 | |
| Matthew Bauer | 85 | |
| Dr. Dianne Lynch | 89 | |
| Susan Corbett | 96 | |
| Leticia Latino-Van Spluteren | 99 | |
| Diversity and Equity Working Group | | |
| Christopher Wood | 118 | |
| Antonio Tijerino | 128 | |
| Jenny Alsayegh | 131 | |
| Aama Nahuja | 135 | |
| Charlyn Stanberry | 138 | |
| Melody Spann Cooper | 141 | |
| Ellen Schned | 161 | |
| Graham Dillard | 181 | |

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

| | | |
|---|-----|-----|
| Digital Empowerment and Inclusion Working Group Report | | |
| Dr. Dominique Harrison | 210 | |
| Dr. Christopher Ali | 226 | |
| Chris James | 225 | |
| Anisa Green | 230 | |
| Matthew Wood | 231 | |
| Clayton Banks | 252 | |
| Questions/Comments from the Public | | 244 |
| Closing Remarks | | |
| Heather Gate | 266 | |
| Dr. Nicol Turner Lee | 270 | |
| Susan Su Allen | 274 | |
| Diana Coho | 276 | |
| Jamila Bess Johnson | 277 | |

Adjourn

P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

10:03 a.m.

MS. SAURER: Good morning and welcome to the June 15 meeting of the Communications Equity and Diversity Council of the Federal Communications Commission.

It's hard to believe, but today will be the final meeting of this inaugural chart of the CEDC. It seems like just yesterday we were inviting this great group experts to assemble and join together and make recommendations on advancing equity in the provision of and access to digital communication services and products for all, and make recommendations you have.

Today, we will hear from each of the working groups on the findings and recommendations that they have assembled for your consideration after two years of workshops, forums, symposia, town halls, research, interviews, and deliberations.

So, with that, we've got a full agenda, but before we get started, there will be

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

a lot of thank you's today, so let me be the first to thank you all for your hard work and dedication to the CEDC. We truly appreciate your service.

I especially want to thank Chair Heather Gate, Vice Chairs Dr. Nicol Turner Lee and Sue Allen, and Working Group Chairs Robert Brooks, Christopher Wood, and Dr. Dominique Harrison.

From my team, I would also like to thank Deputy Chair Hillary DeNigro and Designated Federal Official Jamila Bess Johnson, and Co-Deputy DFO Diana Coho of the Consumer and Governmental Affairs Bureau, and Ashley Tyson of the Wireline Competition Bureau.

Our published agenda reflects that we'll begin today's remarks from the Chairwoman and Commissioners. Due to scheduling issues, Commissioner Starks' remarks were prerecorded and the Chairwoman will now be speaking later this morning.

So, we will move forward with the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

programming and receive remarks from the Commissioners and the Chairwoman as they arrive.

So, now, without further delay, I would like to introduce Commissioner Carr to provide his opening remarks. Thank you, Commissioner.

COMMISSIONER CARR: Do I do it up here or where is the best spot?

MS. SAURER: Right here, right here.

COMMISSIONER CARR: Okay, it feels a little odd to be up here, but obviously, thank you so much for the chance to address you all, and obviously, thank you for all of the tremendous work that you've put in over this long period of time.

I know each and every one of you has a day job that is probably more than a full-time job and you've taken this on on top of that, and so I really appreciate and am grateful for all of the work that you've been doing, and I'm very much looking forward to the final recommendations that are going to come out of this group.

I'm also pleased to see that the Chair

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

has initiated the re-chartering of this organization for another two years. It does remind me of an old saying that, you know, the prize for winning a pie eating contest is more pie, and maybe for some of you, that may be in store, that congrats on getting this done, but you'll probably be enlisted potentially to go another round, but I'm very interested in what you all have to do.

There's no question that we have work to do to improve diversity across the communications sector. I think broadcast is one area where I think we struggle. You know, we have still something in the single digits when it comes to minority ownership of, you know, full power broadcast television.

I was supportive of a transaction that would put us out of the single digits into the double digits, but that didn't get full support from the Commission, so maybe we'll try again another go around.

But, look, I do think we need to make

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

sure that, among other things, our processes for mergers and transactions are clear on the front end, because if it's murky, that itself is a, it's a barrier to people deciding to consummate transactions.

One issue that I sort of supported was this idea of an incubator program in the radio space where we would give some regulatory relief to radio stations in exchange for incubating smaller entrepreneurial new entrants, and we were really excited about that.

Unfortunately, that was stayed for a long time based on a Third Circuit decision, but now it's back in effect and I think we need to sort of look at reinvigorating that incubator so that it succeeds.

I've also talked about the idea of taking that incubator program and moving it into the TV space, not just sort of radio space, and that could sort of another important step forward.

But, look, we've got a unique

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

opportunity right now as a country. We've got something, you know, like \$40-plus billion at Commerce that can be used for broadband infrastructure, digital divide efforts. If you step back from there, I've counted something like \$800 billion that could be available for broadband infrastructure.

So, the interesting thing is for years we have wanted to close the digital divide, but to some extent lacked sort of the resources to fully do it, but we're in a different spot right now, like we now have the funding in a lot of ways to do it if we get the policies right, and that's sort of the challenge is making sure that we get these policies right so that every single person, regardless of zip code, has access to a high-speed internet connection.

And for me, it's really, it's sort of a real important everyday thing. I was in the Sharswood neighborhood of Philadelphia a couple of years ago. I was at an event at a school there and I met a young woman named Tommy, and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

she dropped out of high school when she had her first kid. She grew up in public housing. And she told me this story about how broadband helped her lift herself up, lift her family up, and really turn her life around.

She used a mobile hotspot to go to school online and she ended up being able to ultimately land a job working at the Philly Housing Authority, and she was getting ready to sort of purchase her own house. She had five kids now. And she was at this event just sort of talking about the value of a connection and what it meant to her.

So, the stuff we do is real and it's important, and so for that reason, I'm, you know, really looking forward to the expertise and the views that you all bring to bear in your recommendations and seeing where we at the FCC can hopefully do more than talk about these issues, but really take concrete action, and I look forward to doing it, so thanks so much, appreciate it.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

(Applause.)

PARTICIPANT: Jamila, please turn on your microphone.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Oh, thank you. I am so sorry. As Holly mentioned, we will have an opportunity to hear from Chairwoman Rosenworcel, and I believe Commissioner Simington and Commissioner Starks, I believe, has taped remarks, so whenever those are ready, we'll present those speakers for you all.

But to move the agenda forward, I just wanted to say -- oh, there is Commissioner Starks on the screen. Commissioner Starks? Jeff, we're not able to hear the commissioner. Thank you.

PARTICIPANT: My apologies. That was very unprofessional of me.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: It's okay. Exasperation is normal.

COMMISSIONER STARKS: Good morning, everyone. I'm excited to be with you for the final meeting of the Communications Equity and Diversity Council under this charter. Chair

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Gate, Vice Chairs Turner Lee and Allen, thank you for inviting me to speak.

The CEDC is a vital part of the Commission's work on diversity and equity and your efforts over the past two years will make a difference, and today's meeting is an important one. I look forward to reviewing the final reports from the working groups that will be presented today.

And to everyone who served on the Innovation in Access Working Group, the Diversity and Equity Working Group, and the Digital Empowerment and Inclusion Working Group, I thank you for your service.

The recommendations the CEDC adopts will shape the policies we consider in the future and lay the foundation for a more equitable policy making world. The reports you vote on today carry significant weight.

The diverse and inclusive makeup of the CEDC means that we can look upon the reports you all adopt with confidence that all

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

stakeholders have participated.

As many of you know, my priorities here at the Commission align with this Council's mission. Ensuring equity and the provision of and access to digital communication services is vital.

It should happen throughout the ecosystem. The workforce creating and deploying technologies should be as diverse as well as the people of this great nation.

Those technologies, once deployed, should be available and accessible, but it's not easy, and that's why the CEDC is so important. Your expertise, your unique background and insights make the recommendations we will hear even stronger.

For the past several years, the CEDC has led the charge to diversity the tech and telecom workforce. Your recent digital ecosystem forum touched on a number of important issues that must be addressed in order for us to make any real headway.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

I heard similar thoughts when I recently visited the Virginia State University with Commissioner Carr to learn about VSU's efforts to train the workforce of the future.

Relatedly, I have worked hard to ensure that we have diversity here at the FCC, and so that's why, in coordination with my former colleague, Ajit Pai, I created the FCC's Early Career Diversity Initiative, an initiative that offers paid internships at the FCC year-round to ensure that the inability to work without pay doesn't hold great students back.

And so, I'm proud to say that I've had an Early Career Staff Diversity intern every semester and summer since the program began in 2020. They have been fantastic and I look forward to supporting their careers.

In closing, I want to thank you again for serving on the CEDC, for your dedication to improving diversity and equity. I'm heartened that it has been rechartered and I'm excited to read your reports. Thank you all, and be safe

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

and be well.

(Applause.)

MS. BESS JOHNSON: And we certainly thank Commissioner Starks who has been very supportive of the agenda of this advisory committee, and we thank him for his remarks this morning.

As we wait for Commissioner Simington to arrive, we'll proceed. Is he here? Oh, hi, good morning. Thank you so much. I didn't see you enter.

COMMISSIONER SIMINGTON: We didn't want to disrupt anything.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Thank you, sir. Thank you.

COMMISSIONER SIMINGTON: Thank you to Jamila for the kind invitation to speak today. This is my second time participating in the Communications Equity and Diversity Council and I once again thank Commissioner staff and other members of the CEDC for participating in this vital work.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Among the topics touched on today will be access to capital and diverse ownership in media, communications, and technology, and I'm particularly interested in these topics.

Support for diversity, equity, and inclusion in industry is, or at least can be sometimes, rather brittle. The reality is that these efforts are sometimes thought of as just a compliance exercise or a public relations maneuver, a corporate cost rather than an economic opportunity.

And, when times get tough and belts tighten as they always do at some companies, even in good times, the so-called inessential can wind up being shed to survive, but that's the wrong way to look at it.

Diverse ownership, especially in media, is not a mere policy goal. It actually forms the foundation of a social interface. It's a way for people to be represented and voices to be heard, but also a conduit to greater social understanding and participation, and that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

couldn't be more critical than it is now.

Access to capital is a primary driver of our dismal diverse ownership rates in media. Access to capital in turn relies on the defensibility of an investable thesis.

Incidentally, a bit of an aside, it might also be helped by the Commission's explicit clarification that a security interest in the proceeds of an asset sale attendant to the transfer of a license, as opposed to a security interest in the license itself, is legal.

Anyway, are media companies worth investing in? Well, who knows? The big A1 and S1 streamers, with their comparatively lighter investment in physical plant and nominally high gross margins, ought to be killing it, but they're not. They've paid through the nose in development and acquisition of IP and they're locked in a Red Queen's race with one another.

Traditional MVPDs and broadcasts, well, the MVPDs had a good ISP business for now, but I wouldn't say that the media side of the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

house is without hurdles, with much of the value in the network and video being pulled out to the networks.

vMVPDs haven't cracked the code either for the same reasons, even though they're more asset light. Broadcast, well, broadcast has been a hard business for a while and it keeps getting harder.

If you have two options for directing your energy and resources, one, a high margin, high multiple technology company, and the other, a single-digit growth or even flatlining media company in secular decline trading a low multiple, where would you put your money? Where would you recommend that your child apply for a job? And, in a touch economic environment, which investment might open up access to the kind of debt facility that you would need to make the investment as a new entrant?

I think the answer there is relatively clear. So, what role does the Commission have in this? Well, we have some programs that we run

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

and that's great, but our much larger lever is the overall shape of our media regulation.

When we burden legacy media with regulation, we lower the asset value of legacy media, and when we do that, we put up a barrier to access to capital.

And, because nearly all ownership in legacy media is non-minority, almost all capital investment from the minority community into legacy media will be fresh and will therefore depend, at least to some degree, on access to financing.

The way, therefore, to improve diverse ownership of legacy media, if it can be improved, is to lighten the regulatory burden on legacy media and try, to the extent possible, to make it a more attractive class of assets for new entrants.

More rules meant to incentivize the required diverse ownership without improving the overall investability of legacy media as a class will have precisely the opposite of the intended

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

effect as talented people who might otherwise flood into the industry are held back by high entrance costs and simply put their money and talent elsewhere.

I look forward to hearing CEDC's ideas on these topics, and thank you very much for the invitation to speak.

(Applause.)

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Thank you, Commissioner. Thank you so much for joining us this morning. I wanted to say, before I pass it onto my colleague, Diana Coho and our Chair, Heather Gate, what an honor and privilege it's been to work with you all for the past two years.

I was acquainted with many of you. Some of you, I met for the first time during this previous charter, and I have been able to witness firsthand your dedication and your passion to these issues.

What the CEDC has been able to accomplish is directly related to the time, the energy, and the effort that you all have put in.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

So, on behalf of the FCC, I want to thank you for your public service.

I want to thank you for making yourselves available for this important work, and I hope that you all will consider rejoining the next charter and certainly sharing our public notice with the nomination criteria within your networks.

And now I'd like to invite Diana Coho to make her opening remarks. Diana?

MS. COHO: Thank you, Jamila. Thanks to all of you. As everyone's stated, it has been such an honor as a privilege to be a part of this, and the dedication and the service that you've all provided is powerful, it's infectious.

I think it was Confucius who first said that if you choose a job that you love, you will never work a day in your life, and that has never been more true for me personally and for what I'm learning from all of you.

In addition to all of the outstanding work and all of the various sectors that you

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

touch, that you're up all night and all weekend working on this stuff too, so thank you, thank you, thank you.

It's been a pleasure and an honor, and I really look forward to hearing you all present your findings and recommendations and sharing them with the public and everyone here today, so thank you and please let me know if I can help you while you're here today. Thanks.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Thank you, Diana. And now to our intrepid Chair of the CEDC, the one and only Ms. Heather Gate. Heather, good morning.

CHAIR GATE: Thank you, Jamila. Do I need to move closer? Thank you. Thank you, Holly, for opening the meeting. Thank you, Jamila Bess Johnson and Diana Coho. You ladies are incredible. This experience would not be as productive and meaningful without your hard work and dedication.

I'd like to begin by thanking Chairwoman Rosenworcel for welcoming us to this

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

platform, and I look forward to her comments and we'll talk further about her.

I'd like to thank the commissioners, Commissioner Simington, Commissioner Carr, and Commissioner Starks for your opening comments. I'm always, always encouraged by your leadership and your understanding of the importance and recognizing the rewards of digital equity or diversity in general, that it is not only important for this country, but it is an investment in our future.

The more we talk about it as not a we must do in corporate and in government, but a we must have, the more we will get results that we need.

So, today marks the end of an incredible journey for me as the Chairwoman of the CEDC. It has been both an honor and a privilege to serve at the behest of Chairwoman Rosenworcel.

I feel a deep sense of pride with the remarkable accomplishments, but cannot take the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

credit. It is all due to all of the hard work of you all and my fellow chairs, so thank you again.

As we gather here today, I would like to take a moment to reflect on the incredible journey that we have undertaken since the beginning of our charter in 2021.

We started this charter when COVID was ravaging the country. It was impactful to our families, to us as individuals, to our workplaces, and the world at large. In fact, this closing meeting, as you know, is our first meeting as a full CEDC, so we get to meet each other for the first time, and say goodbye, but only for a moment --

(Laughter.)

CHAIR GATE: But only for a moment, as Jamila said, I fully expect.

It has been a period filled with dedication, collaboration, unwavering commitment to our shared goals. Over the past couple of years, our Council has demonstrated remarkable diligence hosting at least 249 meetings.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

These gatherings served as a critical platform for us to collaborate, exchange ideas, and shape our collective vision for digital equity, supply diversity, minority broadcasting, digital skilling, and have a discussion about non-traditional anchor institution.

Through these interactions, we've fostered an environment of open dialogue, encouraged every voice to be heard and valued. Was it challenging at times? Of course. That is to be expected when you have a very large group of people coming from diverse environments and who are passionate about the work they do, but our accomplishments extend far beyond the confines of our meetings.

We tirelessly reach out to diverse stakeholders from every corner of our great nation and territory, from community leaders to industry experts, state broadband directors, concerned citizens representing marginalized communities.

We have actively sought out

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

perspectives and listened attentively to their experiences, challenges, frustrations, and concerns, and their successes as well when we talk about the activities that a lot of organizations undertook during the pandemic. Whether it was one to one interviews, virtual town hall meetings, convenings, panels, we sought insights from them.

So, more specifically, in September of 2022, we hosted a Digital Skills Gap Symposium and Town Hall meeting that you'll hear more about, on February 7, Media Ownership and Diversity Symposium, March 6, a Digital Ecosystem Forum, and then March 23, we hosted a round table to discuss the lessons learned from the pandemic.

This commitment to inclusivity and broad representation has been the cornerstone of our work. By engaging with stakeholders from various backgrounds, we have gained invaluable insights and acquired a holistic understanding of the issues that we seek to explore.

The input has provided us with the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

necessary groundwork to develop well-informed recommendations to the FCC that reflect the diverse needs and aspirations of the diverse communities that we engaged with.

When we kicked off our charter, Chairwoman Rosenworcel asked the CEDC to offer recommendations for model policies and best practices for states and localities to prevent digital discrimination.

This was because Section 60506 of the bipartisan infrastructure law charged the FCC with offering guidance on these issues to states and localities. This was a complex and critical important task for the CEDC and I want to thank every member of the three working groups who worked diligently to contribute to this effort.

The CEDC report and recommendations were adopted on November 22, and on November 30, the FCC released a notice for proposed rulemaking in the matter of implementing the Infrastructure Investment and Jobs Act preventing and eliminating digital discrimination, which

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

included the CEDC's report on digital discrimination. So, thank you. Thank you very much for all of your efforts to put that report together.

We hope and we know that our contribution to the FCC's work on digital equity and full digital access will be impactful for Americans. The comments from this NPRM, coupled with the work of the FCC Task Force to Prevent Digital Discrimination, should equip the FCC with the intelligence to issue the guidance required against digital discrimination. We anticipate the release of this guidance coming from the FCC.

I want to close by reiterating something you may have heard thousands of times over the past couple of years. This is a critical time in our history with big investments in infrastructure. It's unprecedented. I am going to use those words over and over again.

We cannot afford to fail. The consequences of failing to bridge the digital divides and achieve digital equity are far-

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

reaching. Education suffers. We know that from the pandemic. We know that economic disparities will continue to widen as more technology advances, artificial intelligence and new technologies that we don't even imagine arise.

Health outcomes are compromised. Telehealth is not available to those people if it does not become the norm. Civic participation and democratic processes are hidden when certain voices are left unheard due to lack of digital access.

So, today our intention, as we are required by our charter, is to make recommendations to the FCC, but we fully would like to request that the FCC share these recommendations with the other agencies that are funded to do some of this work, the NTIA, Treasury, and Congress, and the White House to ensure that we continue to make progress.

It is through this collective effort that we have sought to synthesize the feedback that we received from all of the people, probably

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

close to 100 people that we've talked to, brought to events, that we interviewed one to one, had follow-up calls with.

Our painstaking analysis fueled by these insights and experiences that were shared with us have allowed us to shape our recommendations today. Make no mistake, there is still a lot of work to be done, and we are encouraged that Chairwoman Rosenworcel has re-chartered this Council to continue this work.

I want to express my deep appreciation for each and every member of this Council for their unwavering dedication, passion, and expertise. Together, we have created a foundation that the FCC can build upon.

To our designated federal officers again, I can't say enough about you. You are the backbone of this operation, managing the logistical complications of getting 70 people is just fantastic and truly amazing.

Your leadership, and your guidance, and support, and often setting us straight when

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

we're not necessarily following protocol were very much appreciated.

To the working group chairs, Chris Wood, Dr. Harrison, and Robert, you often -- I remind people that council and committee work gets done by working group chairs. You carry the load. You are the ones that are left with the pen. I appreciate you and I recognize your commitment and the amount of time and effort you've put over the past years, so thank you. Thank you so much.

To the workstream leads, we'll hear from you if I have to wait and thank you later, but to the workstream leads, you took the pen, put to paper and got working, so I appreciate all of that work too.

And then last, but not least, I would like to thank my esteemed co-chairs. Your exceptional leadership, your passion, and your dedication to this work is inspiring to me, and having gotten to know you all for the last six years, it's authentic. It's real. And I

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

appreciate the last phone calls, and the passion, and your hard work and dedication.

Nicol, I'm not going to age us, but we were refurbishing computers and explaining to people what the digital divide was many, many years ago.

Susan, you walked into my life like a little firecracker and I've appreciated every moment of it, so thank you for serving with me and making me a better person. So, I look forward to a lifetime with you. You can't get rid of me.

So, on that note, I would like to hand the floor over to Dr. Nicol Turner Lee to pick up from there. Thank you all.

(Applause.)

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: Thank you, Heather. I assume that I'm on, correct? Well, first and foremost, I want to thank the FCC Chairwoman, the Commissioners, those who have spoken and those that will speak to us today.

Our committed Jamila Bess Johnson, who

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

has been doing this for quite some time, thank you for keeping this as a special part of the work that you do at the Commission and part of your heart.

Diana and Ashley, excuse me, who recently joined us, but joined in like they were pro athletes wrangling us together, as well as others who, during the course of the two years, Keyla and others who were with us, that, you know, had to go onto bigger and greater things.

I also so want to thank our Chair, Heather Gate. She's not lying. We've known each other for decades when we first started out in this work, and Vice Chair, who I've also gotten to know over the years through my work at MMTC previous to Brookings. Their leadership and dedication should not go unnoticed. These are some hard workers.

And to the members of this full advisory, thank you for your two years of dedication here and your individual workstream efforts. As it was indicated, many hours were

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

spent in your service and you have other jobs, and today's meeting is basically going to bear witness to the depth and the breadth of the work that you did.

As the CEDC presents its findings in this last meeting of the charter, of this particular charter, I want to echo what Chairwoman Gate shared in terms of the depth and breadth of the work of this distinguished group.

And these quantifiable inputs of the time spent, the number of workshops, the people interviewed, I think have led to very thoughtful recommendations that those in the public who are watching us today will hear, and those who are with us in person here at the Commission.

And what I want to just highlight in my few minutes of time is what some of those things are and how they're actually going to piece together what I think are a serious narrative of the contributions that are critically important to the soul of this country and to the future of digital access to the people

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

that the individuals and organizations around this table represent.

In today's society, being online is imperative to engage both essential and nonessential activities, from being able to recertify public benefits, stay up to date with vaccinations and healthcare, complete pre-applications in employment, let alone hiring interviews that have to happen online.

Broadband technologies have not only developed over decades to enable even faster mobile connections like 5G, but it also carries the weight of emerging technologies, including artificial intelligence and now generative AI powered by large language models.

At the heart of these digital transformations is an ecosystem that will have either a positive or negative impact. On the one hand, you all remember during COVID, it enabled the ability of people to experience and be involved in the consequential discourse of our society on a very, very sad day in May when we

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

experienced during the pandemic, through the filming of smartphones, the death of George Floyd in Minnesota under the egregious acts of bad apples in law enforcement that reinforce racism and discrimination in that institution. That was a positive discourse because it led to action and a conviction.

On the other hand, technology can skirt existing civil and human rights by fueling misinformation and disinformation, suppressing authentic and locally-owned and grown voices from countering with truth, and in times of democratic fragility, suppress and disenfranchise people from exercising their voting rights, learning, working, and aging in respect and dignity.

That same technology that we, as a committee, want to make equally accessible to people, to mobilize, and inspire them, and encourage them, can harm, restrict, and regress progress.

And so, while there have been many federal and state actors involved in these

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

debates, and I'm talking about this agency, the Federal Communications Commission is the core agency responsible for ensuring universal and equitable access to our communications' infrastructure.

And while the Commission has not yet said how they're going to debate AI, I know it's coming because I've read the website, I'm hoping that the next iteration of the CEDC takes on these emerging technologies because they have the same impact of the digital divide will happen in these new spaces.

And so, those of you know that I'm a true loyalist to the digital divide, and as many of you, if you didn't know it before, you now know what that work entails, but I think at the end, as I'll just summarize in my closing, some of the thoughtful recommendations that are not only going to close the digital divide, but make this a digitally just society, one in which we should all be striving for.

As Heather said, some of the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

recommendations appeal to the Commission directly and other recommendations, for those of you who are listening, will appeal to Congress, the National Telecommunications Information Administration at the U.S. Commerce Department, the Department of Labor, and as high as the White House.

Some of these recommendations we're going to hear today are looking to industry and local communities to do something different outside of the normal paradigms of diversity, equity, and inclusion.

And as it's going to be mentioned, some of these resources and recommendations go as far as engaging local community organizations, and we'll talk and hear more about that today from many of these groups.

The recommendations that we'll hear starting out at the beginning of this charter implored us to look at this thing called digital discrimination, which was the big part of the time that we spent in this charter, which is a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

statutory requirement of the bipartisan infrastructure bill.

And honestly, I think we're going to find out that we need to keep talking about this because not only do we need to further explore what that means, but also determine greater culpability of other actors, including federal and state governments who actually, by the way, started historical residential redlining.

So, thinking about this, as well as proposals for upskilling at a time where people with or without college degrees or technical training should be working as a result of these short and long-term investments.

We're going to hear about minority and women-owned suppliers who must be part of the broadband supply chain, who should share in this treasure trove of federal investments in infrastructure.

We're going to hear today about who speaks to and for our communities, including minority and women-owned broadcasters who are the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

trusted voices of the people that we, in this room, rely upon every day to get our news and information.

And we're also going to hear about, again, this critical need to build local infrastructure or nontraditional anchor institutions, faith-based organizations, community-based organizations, entrepreneurial organizations that should be valued versus undervalued in the current federal investments.

Right now, my friends, I'm proud to say I was part of this committee, not just in the role as vice chair, but as somebody that you allowed us to shepherd this process alongside my friends here, Chairwoman Gate and Vice Chair Susan Allen.

And I'm proud to say that, because I think outside of Henry Rivera and David Honig, I've been on this committee since Chairman Genachowski.

(Laughter.)

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: And while much

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

progress has been made, there's a lot more to be done.

And so, with the national recognition of Juneteenth upon us and a statement of reconstitution of the CEDC's charter, I feel comfortable saying that one day, the work that we've been doing will be the guidance for the new abolitionists and intervention of existing social structure.

But I also want to say this as well, because I have gotten to know each and every one of you, that the individuals and organizations represented on this advisory, from the LGBTQ population, the disabled, women, people of color, tribal communities, and for all of us who experience an intersectional reality of living in many of those worlds, you are the soul of America.

And so, as we have this conversation today, for those again who are following this committee and the work of the last two years, let's do something about it so that we can

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

actually move forward with change and not regress as the technology progresses. Thank you.

(Applause.)

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: And now I pass it over to the other activists.

(Laughter.)

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Thank you so much, Vice Chair Dr. Nicol Turner Lee, for those passionate and elegant remarks. And now we will turn to our Chairwoman at the FCC who has arrived, the honorable Jessica Rosenworcel.

(Applause.)

CHAIRWOMAN ROSENWORCEL: I'm going to be honest. I'm a little intimidated following that fire from Nicol.

(Laughter.)

CHAIRWOMAN ROSENWORCEL: I can say that. She's been a friend for a long time. All right, good morning. Oh, my gosh, it's terrific to see you all here and be with the CEDC.

I went back and I was counting because at this point, I think I've spoken to you about

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

half a dozen times at all of these meetings, all of these workshops, but today's gathering is special because this is the last meeting of this iteration of the CEDC.

And it's in June, which is totally appropriate because this is like your graduation ceremony, and I know graduation ceremonies run long, but I notice that you're meeting from 10:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. today, so that is probably a record of some sort.

Now, many of you may not do this, but I have this habit. I actually like watching graduation speeches. If you're looking for a little inspiration, looking for someone to try to explain to you how they see the world, I'm just going to submit to you there's no better thing than tracking some down.

And it turns out that this week is the 18th anniversary of one of the most famous graduation speeches, and it was the graduation speech that Steve Jobs gave at Stanford University.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

And one thing that's really notable about this legendary speech, even though he reportedly spent six months working on it, yeah, and he worked on it and called Aaron Sorkin for input, by the way, that's not a privilege I have, but anyway, Steve Jobs punctuated his thoughts after all of that work and all of that expertise with something awfully simple. He ended his speech with what might be the most tired graduation cliché of all. Follow your heart.

So, apparently you can give trite advice when you're the greatest innovator of your generation and lots of people clap, but again, he also overcame dropping out of college, getting fired from the company he founded, and battling cancer, and an immigrant to boot. Thank you, Tony.

So, anyway, I share this with you for two reasons. The first is by being part of this group, you've actually lived this cliché. You've spent the past two years working on this committee and you've put your heart and soul into

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

it, and I know that and I appreciate it.

Because if you think about it, every single person who is sitting on this committee has achieved some pretty hot success in this professional lives.

We invited you here because you're among the best in the tech and telecom sector, and if you think I'm exaggerating, just take note the previous leader of this little organization has recently been nominated to be an FCC Commissioner.

(Applause.)

CHAIRWOMAN ROSENWORCEL: I've got a lot of committees. I can't say that about any other one.

(Laughter.)

CHAIRWOMAN ROSENWORCEL: So, this means your time is valuable. It's also limited and we have paid you in nothing but our deep gratitude, but I know, again, in your hearts, that you believe in the importance of what this group is doing.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

You believe in some words I really like from the late Senator Paul Wellstone. We all do better when we all do better.

All right, so that brings me to my second point. When people, and especially young people, venture out into the world, we always tell them you should go follow your hearts, just like Steve Jobs did that day. Follow your passion.

Now, implicit in that message are a few things, but it's really the idea that if you work hard, persevere, play by the rules, that is just the path to happiness and success. See, there's a catch. That path is not the same for everyone. Where some find open doors, others are going to be met with obstacles.

Because, let's face it, no matter who you are and what your aspirations are, it's not always easy out there, but it's even harder if you don't have the same access to capital as others who are trying to start a business.

It's even harder to believe you can do

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

great things when you look at others who are out there and you don't see too many success stories like you. It's even harder if you don't have the same access to broadband because you just don't live in the right zip code.

That's why the CEDC exists, to help us level the playing field, to make sure that following your heart isn't a false promise if you don't fit in the right demographic profile.

And as the first woman to lead this agency, confirmed to do so after 87 years, believe me, I know something about not fitting the demographic profile.

You've done some remarkable work over the past two years. You had to do a lot of it virtually, so that's why it's a special treat to see you all here today, but you've done work to help reduce barriers and promote equal opportunity.

You've expanded this committee's historic focus not from just being on the media ecosystem to the broader technology sector. I

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

think that's really important.

You've also played an indispensable role in the Commission's efforts to adopt rules to crack down on digital discrimination, because the bipartisan infrastructure law tasked this Commission with a really important task, to develop rules and policies to prevent that kind of discrimination and redlining, and to set up model codes that we can share across this country and globally to help do so, and you've been a formidable part of that.

You've also helped to set up some workshops for actionable advice on securing access to capital, updating skill set, and what the evolving technology marketplace needs for job candidates.

You've helped create mentoring opportunities. That's a lot. And please, again, I recognize that we have paid you just with our gratitude, so we are grateful for your time and your service.

I also am grateful to the FCC staff

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

who have helped shepherd this initiative. They're really tremendous and they too get paid a lot of times just in gratitude.

All right, so let me thank them, Jamila Bess Johnson, Ashley Tyson, and Diana Coho, but I also really want to thank the people I started with, and that includes Chair Heather Gate, the fiery Nicol Turner Lee, and Susan Allen. It's been terrific to have you working at the helm of this organization and I'm proud to see three women doing it.

Thanks also to our working group leaders, Robert Brooks, Dr. Dominique Harrison, and Christopher Wood.

So, at this point, I feel like I need pomp and circumstance because I said this was a graduation, right? But you don't want me humming or singing, trust me on that, plus you have seven hours of work ahead of you, so we're going to crank a little more out before we call this a day, but let me say thank you again.

Our work here isn't done. You know

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

that and I know that, but you've gotten some big things started and we are absolutely going to be re-chartering this council and I hope many of you will come back for another two years of service, and, of course, our undying gratitude. Thank you all for being here today and thank you for being a part of this.

(Applause.)

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Thank you so much, Chairwoman Rosenworcel, for sharing in our final charter meeting today. And now we will have opening remarks from Vice Chair Susan Au Allen. Susan?

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: Thank you, Jamila. I think I could just say that you've heard it all. However, I did work late last night until 5:54 this morning to prepare a short statement.

First of all, I want to say ditto, ditto, ditto to everything that Jamila has said, Heather, you have said, Nicol, of course, and thank you, Chairwoman Rosenworcel for the nice

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

words.

I am Susan Au Allen. I serve as Vice Chair under the leadership of this august panel here and I am also the CEO of the U.S. Pan Asian American Chamber of Commerce Education Foundation.

As always, I want to thank FCC Chairwoman Rosenworcel for your vision and continued leadership, and your very encouraging words this morning.

Our council makes recommendations to the FCC on advancing equity in the provision of and access to digital communication services and products for all people of the United States without discrimination on the basis of race, color, religion, national origin, sex, or disability.

Our work includes accelerating the deployment of high-speed, reliable, and affordable broadband in all communities by reducing or removing regulatory barriers to infrastructure investment, and recommendations to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

strengthen existing broadband networks and build new ones.

Today, we will hear the findings and recommendations of three hard-working CEDC working groups about innovation and access, digital empowerment and inclusion, and diversity and equity. I want to join my leadership to thank them for their diligent work over the last two years.

You see, digital media is transforming the way we communicate, learn, work, and play. It offers unprecedented opportunities for innovation, collaboration, and economic development.

It empowers us to access information, express ourselves, and connect with others across the globe, but it's not just a tool or platform.

It is also a culture and a community. It reflects our values, our identities, and our aspirations no matter what you look like, what color you were born in.

It shapes our perceptions, our

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

opinions, and our actions. It influences our society, our economy, and our democracy. That's why we must ensure that digital media is accessible, affordable, and inclusive for all people in the United States, especially now days for the underserved and unserved.

Accelerating the entry of small businesses, including those owned by underserved and unserved Americans, into the media, digital news, and information, and audio and video programming industries must be a national priority.

We believe that digital media can be a powerful force of good. It can help to bridge the digital divide, promote civic engagement, fortify supplier diversity in economic development, and foster social justice.

It can enrich our culture, enhance our education, and improve our health, but we recognize that digital media can pose challenges and risks, create new forms of exclusion and discrimination, as well as misinformation.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

It can also disrupt traditional media models, markets, and regulations. That's why we must be proactive, collaborative, and receptive.

We need to embrace the opportunities that are coming our way and address the challenges that digital media poses in a way that balances innovation and regulation, competition and cooperation, freedom and responsibility.

We should also be mindful of the trends and changes that are shaping the digital media landscape. According to Deloitte's 2023 Digital Media Trends report, younger generations are weaving TV, gaming, and user-generated content into a tapestry of entertainment, community, and meaning. They want more connection, immersion, and value from their digital media activities. They prefer social media and gaming over traditional TV and movies.

These trends suggest that digital media is becoming more social, interactive, and immersive, challenging traditional media in reach and appeal. We need to take note of that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

seriously.

What does this mean for the underserved community? How can we ensure that everyone has equal access to and representation in digital media? How can we leverage it to empower the underserved community that we always talk about and think about?

These are important questions and that's why it is essential that we continue to engage stakeholders, host events like today's public meeting, and develop recommendations on issues germane to digital media equity and diversity such as digital skills gap, digital discrimination, digital empowerment, digital inclusion, digital diversity.

We invite you to join us in this important work and move recommendations into real action. We welcome your input, feedback, and collaboration. Together we can make digital media more equitable and diverse for everyone. Thank you for listening.

(Applause.)

CHAIR GATE: Okay, thank you. Thank you. You're amazing. I can't compliment you any more. So, I would like to call to order the June 15, 2023 meeting of the CEDC final meeting.

We will begin with the roll call, but before I hand the floor over to Jamila to do that, I wanted to remind those that are participating virtually to turn your camera and your mic on when your name is called and then please go ahead and turn it off as soon as you're done, and so, Jamila, go ahead.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Thank you so much, Chair Gate. I will proceed with the roll, and when we're done, if I haven't called your name, please acknowledge your presence. Chris Wood?

MEMBER C. WOOD: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Aama Nahuja?

MEMBER NAHUJA: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Antonio Tijerino?

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: Jamila, Chris just acknowledged that he's on. He just couldn't respond.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Oh, thank you.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: Okay?

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Okay, thank you.

MEMBER TIJERINO: Here.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Thank you. Charlyn
Stanberry?

MEMBER STANBERRY: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Graham "Skip"
Dillard?

MEMBER DILLARD: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Thank you. Jill
Houghton?

MEMBER HOUGHTON: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Melody Spann
Cooper?

MEMBER SPANN COOPER: Here.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Rosa Mendoza?

MEMBER MENDOZA: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Dr. Ronald Johnson?

(No audible response.)

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Brian Scarpelli?

MEMBER SCARPELLI: Present.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Brigitte Daniel-
Corbin?

(No audible response.)

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Ellen Schned?

MEMBER SCHNED: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Faith Bautista?

MEMBER BAUTISTA: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Thank you. Jenny
Alsayegh?

MEMBER ALSAYEGH: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Mona Thompson?

MEMBER THOMPSON: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Otto Padron?

(No audible response.)

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Robert Brooks?

(No audible response.)

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Raul Alarcon?

(No audible response.)

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Susan Au Allen?

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: Here.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Matthew Bauer?

(No audible response.)

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

MS. BESS JOHNSON: David Honig?

MEMBER HONIG: Here.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Henry Rivera?

MEMBER RIVERA: Here.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Steven Roberts?

MEMBER ROBERTS: Present. Also, for Jim Winston, he is trying to get in. He just texted me. He's at the NABOB Media Sales Institute graduation today in Atlanta, so I guess I'll be his proxy if he's not able to get in.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Thank you.

MEMBER ROBERTS: Thank you.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Joycelyn Tate?

MEMBER TATE: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Dr. Dianne Lynch?

MEMBER LYNCH: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Susan Corbett?

MEMBER CORBETT: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Monica Desai.
Charles Harrell. Jennifer Jackson.

MEMBER JACKSON: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Letecia Latino-van

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Splunteren.

(No audible response.)

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Eve Lewis.

MEMBER LEWIS: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Dr. Jon Gant,
sorry.

MEMBER GANT: Yeah, present. Morning,
present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Okay, Gant, thank
you, Dr. Gant.

Edgar Class.

MEMBER CLASS: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Alicia Tambe.

(No audible response.)

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Dr. Dominique
Harrison.

MEMBER HARRISON: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Yvette Badu-Nimako.

(No audible response.)

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Clayton Banks.

MEMBER BANKS: Here.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Robert Branson.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

MEMBER BRANSON: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Michelle Cober.

MEMBER COBER: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Chris James.

MEMBER JAMES: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Nicolaine Lazarre.

MEMBER LAZARRE: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Vickie Robinson.

MEMBER ROBINSON: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Antonio Williams.

(No audible response.)

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Dr. Christopher
Ali.

MEMBER ALI: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Anisa Green.

MEMBER GREEN: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Matt Wood.

MEMBER WOOD: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Rebecca Gibbons.

MEMBER GIBBONS Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Hooman Hedayati.

MEMBER HEDAYATI: Present.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Louis Peraertz.

MEMBER PERAERTZ: Present.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Is anyone present in the meeting who did not hear their name called?

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: I didn't hear my name called.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: I am so sorry.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: Dr. Nicol Turner Lee. I was doing -- put you with the --

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: I know I got married, but I still have my old name.

(Laughter.)

MEMBER WILLIAMS: Jamila, this is Tony Williams as well.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Okay, thank you, Antonio. Okay.

MEMBER PADRON: And Jamila, this is Otto Padron from a very busy fifth grader graduation.

(Laughter.)

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Well, that sounds

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

like fun. Thank you, Otto. Okay.

Madam Chair, that completes the roll, and you have a quorum.

CHAIR GATE: Thank you, Jamila.

And now we proceed to our working group presentations. But before we do, again, some information for the virtual participants.

When we -- when it's time for Q&A or if you have something to contribute, please be sure to unmute and turn your camera on. And please use the raise-hand feature if you would like to speak and the FCC staff will let me know and you will be acknowledged.

I know the chat feature is very tempting. So please remember that we can't see it and raise your hand and articulate those thoughts. We would love to get them on record.

And now I would like us to proceed to our working group presentations. And to kick off the working group presentations is the chair of the Innovation and Access Working Group, Robert Brooks.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

The floor is yours.

MEMBER BROOKS: Thank you. Can you guys hear me on the mic? Clear, okay, great.

Okay, good morning, everybody. And I think I'll start this off first of all saying it's great to see everybody in person who's here, especially those I've been working with directly for the last two years immensely.

You know, after two years of vigorous work with everybody, one of the best things to wake up to is when you get a email in the morning that says okay, here's your agenda. And oh by the way, you're the first working group that's going to present in two years.

And so you know, and that's not a bad thing at all, it's a great thing. You know, it's going to be a good presentation from the working groups. Everyone's put a lot of work into this.

I would say just kind of looking at everything that's been collected and presented and researched that there's some things you're going to see.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

For me, two highlights really were digital in particular. Digital from the form of expansion of access to broadband, impact on opportunities and business and otherwise. And then also upscaling and the importance of that. And these are just a few things.

At the same time, there's also the importance of still supporting and the very impactful role that terrestrial and traditional broadcast and media entities still have in our society. And so you'll hear about these things as we go through.

And I would like to start off with this, is kind of just giving a quick highlight, next slide please, of our team. Our team's composed of 23 members from all various areas of expertise. I will go through the names very quickly to make sure everyone gets their recognition.

Raul Alarcon, Susan Allen, Matthew Bauer, Caroline Beasley, Cecilia Gordon, David Honig, Sherman Kizart, Henry Rivera, Steven

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Roberts, Joycelyn Tate, Barbara Ciara, Susan Corbett, Monica Desai, Charles Harrell II. Which Charles, nice to see you too, I just saw you walk in earlier, so.

C. Howie Hodges II, Jennifer J. Jackson, Letecia Latino-van Splunteren, Eve Lewis, Dr. John Gant, Dr. Dianne Lynch, Edgar Class, and Alicia Tambe. Next slide.

The objectives of the Innovation and Access Working Group were, first one, recommend solutions to reduce entry barriers and encourage ownership and management of media digital communication services in next generation technology properties and startups to encourage viewpoint diversity by a broad range of voices including people of color, women, LGBTQ, and persons with disabilities among others.

The second was to study successful approaches to fostering diversity, equity, and non-discrimination in video, media, and technology ownership. Management in distribution. Make recommendations on how to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

accelerate the entry of small businesses including those owned by women and people of color into the media, digital news, and information and audio and video programming industries, including as owners, suppliers and employees.

And lastly to examine issues surrounding access to capital, financing, and participation of small, diverse businesses in the media and technology sectors. Evaluate and impact of new technologies including algorithms on diverse consumers. Next slide.

To tackle these goals, we were split across three workstreams. The workstreams were between 9-11 individuals per stream, with the very first workstream focused on recommendations to ensure inclusive practices by identifying and selecting participating entrepreneurs in the Infrastructure Investment and Jobs Act, contracting and grant processes.

This was led by Anna Gomez and consisted of nine members. The second one was

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Access to Capital. Access to Capital was led by C. Howie Hodges, consisted of 11 members. Workstream 3 was dealing with digital equity and closing the digital skills gap. Also composed of 11 members, led by Matthew Bauer.

Some members that you'll see on these committees, particularly in Workstream 2 and 3, also served on Workstream 1. So thank you for doing double work, you know, and being committed to both of them, because that was extensive on all accounts.

For Workstream 1, their primary goal from an overview standpoint -- next slide -- was to prevent digital discrimination and ensure that all Infrastructure Investment and Jobs Act's grantees meet local community needs by recommending a framework for federal and state grant administrators and procurement processes to promote access to opportunities for small and diverse businesses.

Workstream 2, which was Access to Capital, concentration was to recommend

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

initiatives to accelerate the entry and participation of small, minority, and women-owned businesses in existing and emerging media tech markets by identifying successful methods for increasing SMW businesses, access to procurement opportunities in media and tech industries; identify the business development and training needs and resources for SMW businesses in media and tech industries; and identify new sources of access to capital, including private -- public and private financing, angel investing, joint ventures, foundation financing, and traditional bank financing resources for our diverse businesses, particularly those engaged in communications, media, and tech-related fields.

Workstream 3 dealt with digital equity closing -- and closing the digital skills gap. Their focus was to provide recommendations for government investment in and financial support for digital skills training to encourage equitable access from small businesses, entrepreneurs, and all individuals and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

communities to receive technological skills and learning to participate fully in U.S. society in kind. Next slide.

I'd like to do a lot of focuses you're going to hear from Workstream 2 and 3. We did want to highlight Workstream 1, the work that they did do.

Workstream 1 was the very -- was the first priority workstream that was tasked with getting recommendations out within the first six months of us being chartered out. Again, led by Anna Gomez.

And I was going to leave it until the end but I'll say it now to just congratulate her for being nominated for being a FCC Commissioner.

So congratulations to her for that.

Being led by Ms. Gomez, there's, as I mentioned, was digital discrimination and ensured that all Infrastructure Investment in JOBS Act grantees meet local community needs by recommending a framework for federal and state government -- state grant administrators and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

procurement processes to promote access to opportunities for small and diverse businesses.

Their goals, just kind of bullet point. Work to increase participation of small, minority, and women-owned businesses in state and local infrastructure and grant and contract opportunities and provide best practices guidance to state and local officials on performing successful outreach to SMW businesses on funding and contract opportunities and how such businesses can apply, partner, and subcontractors and assist in efforts to widely deploy and increase the take-up rate of broadband in diverse communities.

Methodology that was used to research, interviews that consisted of about ten interviews from individuals from a variety of experiences. And this led to a total of 12 recommendations that were presented in July 22 -- July 22 in 2022. Next slide.

From a recommendations standpoint, there recommendations that were provided to them

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

to - I'm sorry, the recommendations that were provided for the adoption -- to adopt definitions of small, minority, and women-owned -- women-owned businesses that are inclusive in intersectional groups, such as LGBT and people with disabilities.

Designate a government-wide office to oversee supplier diversity initiatives, including the creation of an annual plan to increase hire diversity. Strongly encourage an accountable goal of no less than 30% to the maximum extent practicable of SMW businesses in state and local infrastructure grant and contract opportunities. And provide incentives to first-tier contractors to partner with SMW businesses.

Next was to include purposeful auditing and in-progress reporting in the contracts and subgrants for real-time accountability and compliance that's committed that ensures that SMW goals are met.

Fifth was the grantees working in conjunction with the Supplier Diversity Office to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

proactively identify contracting and procurement forecasting needs.

Six was to require visible leadership.

The last five included streamlined procurement, next slide, processes for all businesses to ensure diverse participation in task forces or committees that advise grantees on their broadband plans, including broadband supplier diversity. To promote certifications prior to disbursement of funds so that SMW businesses are prepared to participate in the funding opportunities.

Grantees, subgrantees, and contractors should be required to reach out to SMW businesses to promote local business opportunities and NTIA should collect and disseminate North Star best practices.

That was the - that's what Workstream 1 did provide. Again, back on July 22, 2022. And with that, I'm going to move this onto Workstream 2.

Workstream 2 was Access to Capital.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

It was led by C. Howie Hodges II. Unfortunately he was not able to be able to present today. But in his place, Jennifer J. Jackson is going to be -- is going to do the presentation.

So Jennifer, if you're ready, we can go ahead and start. Move that slide.

MEMBER JACKSON: Thanks, Robert.

On behalf of Howie Hodges, the leader of Workstream 2 for Access to Capital and all the members of Workstream 2, we are pleased to report to you all today our recommendations.

Our description. Our workstream was assigned to recommend initiatives to accelerate the entry and participation of small, minority, and woman-owned businesses, also known as SMWs or SMEs, in existing and emerging media/tech markets by, one, identifying successful methods for increasing SMW businesses, access to procurement opportunities in media and tech industries.

Number two, identifying the business development training needs and resources for SMW businesses in media and tech industries.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Number three, identifying new sources of access to capital, including public and private financing, angel investing, joint ventures, foundation financing, and traditional bank financing resources for diverse businesses, particularly those engaged in communications, media, and tech-related fields.

Our goals consisted of the following.

One, to provide opportunity for conversation, deliberation, and recommendations on how to assess SMW businesses in accessing wider opportunities for access to capital.

And number two, to identify best practices for public and private funders and other resource entities to provide support to diverse entrepreneurs.

With the diversity of workstream, which includes individuals from the fields of journalism, technology, business owners, lawyers, and banks, and more, this allowed us to have lively, thoughtful, and fierce conversations during our weekly meeting. Next slide.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Our action items were as follows. Number one, to conduct research including collaboration with other CEDC members who may be subject matter experts on access to capital and supplier diversity.

Number two, interview capital market industry experts to compile information on challenges, barriers, as well as opportunities for acquiring equity, angel investments, and other sources of capital for minority entrepreneurs.

And number three, to collect relevant resources that might benefit current and potential business owners in the field.

Our deliverables included the following. One, to research findings that identify opportunities and barriers to capital, for access to capital. Number two, to compile information from working group interviews with subject matter experts.

Number three, one-on-one interviews conducted during the period of fourth quarter of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

fiscal year >22 through first quarter of fiscal year 2023. And some of these interviews included interviews with CEDC members Raul Alarcon, Jim Winston, David Honig, and Melody Spann-Cooper.

Additionally, some of the expert -- industry experts we interviewed included Nicole Elam from the National Bankers Association, Frederick Royall from Chase Bank, Daniel Dana (phonetic) from U.S. Bank, Mike Johns from Digital Mind State, among many others.

And then our final delivery -- deliverable rather, is to deliver a white paper report and findings, which has been ongoing through June of this month. Next slide.

Our finalized work includes the following. The first section includes an overview of the content, which includes an introduction with deliberations and recommendations. The recommendations of Workstream 2. And an extensive resource list.

Some highlights from our research included in the final report but not as

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

recommendations include the following. The impact of additional evolution on opportunities for business development and funding. Evan Shapiro's Media Map, which is really quite fascinating. It shows the vastness of companies in media.

Our traditional platforms, such as Disney and Comcast, technology platforms such as Facebook and Apple, and gaming platforms, just to name a few. We hope that everyone gets an opportunity to take a look at the map in our report.

Additional highlights include the importance for continuing to support broadcast businesses and their impact on the community, which was really highly noted by Steven Roberts in one of our one-on-one interviews.

And then finally the resource list, which really provides an extensive list of opportunities composed from research to help entrepreneurs and business owners. And a really big special thanks to Joycelyn for pulling that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

together. Next slide.

The recommendations in our final report are as follows. Recommendation number one, I&A Workstream 2 recommends that the FTC develop and outreach and public awareness campaign that targets women and minorities with information about the Office of Communication Business Opportunity's role in promoting participation of small business, women, and minorities in the communication industry.

Recommendation number two. I&A Workstream 2 recommends that the Commission discuss with congressional leaders the desirability, size, and structure of a broadcast diversity fund to boost SWMs.

Recommendation number three. We recommend that the Commission urge Congress to adopt legislation to restore and update the tax certificate policy.

Number four, we recommend that the Commission urge Congress to pass the Broadcast VOICES Act.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Recommendation number five. We recommend that the Commission spearhead the planning for an interagency task force that would include federal agencies with regulatory jurisdiction over issues impacting SMW businesses, including those issues pertaining to loan guarantees and federal advertising contracts and expenditures. Next slide.

In addition to the five recommendations just stated, there are three more. Our workstream reviewed several previously adopted recommendations by earlier FCC diversity advisory committees.

I&A Workstream 2 supports the following previously developed recommendations and recommends that the CEDC present the following recommendations to the Commission for reconsideration.

Number one, training for asset acquisitions and mergers. Number two, procurement and supplier diversity programs, which include -- would include extending the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

cable procurement rule to all FCC regulating industries and new communication technology supplier diversity program.

And then finally number three, creating an entity to purchase loans in the secondary marketplace made to minority and small businesses.

Our final report delivery date is June 15, today, 2023. On behalf of Workstream 2, this concludes our report. And on behalf of Howie Hodges, leader of Workstream 2, he would like to thank all the Workstream 2 members for all of their work done, seen and unseen, to get us here today.

And our chair, Robert Brooks, for his unwavering dedication. And Jamila Bess Johnson for keeping us on point.

Thank you for your time today.

Robert.

(Applause.)

MEMBER BROOKS: Thank you, Jennifer.
And also thank you to all Workstream 2, and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

specifically Howie Hodges for everything that was presented and put together.

With that stated, I do want to open it up for questions for Workstream 2. You can go to the next slide.

CHAIR GATE: Robert, I want to acknowledge Robert Rivera has hand raised virtually.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Henry, it's Henry Rivera.

CHAIR GATE: Henry, Henry Rivera.

MEMBER BROOKS: Hey, Henry.

MEMBER RIVERA: Thanks, Heather, thanks, Robert. I just wanted to underscore the existence of that resources document that's in our report.

And I hope that the folks from OCBO would see fit to incorporate that specifically onto their website. It contains a tremendous number of resources that might be very helpful to people who are interested in getting into the telecommunications business.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

So I just, again, just want to underscore that particular document within the report. I hope it doesn't get lost.

Thank you very much.

MEMBER BROOKS: Thank you, Henry. Are there any more questions? Okay, all right. Thank you for the time for Workstream 2. We're going to go ahead and move forward with Workstream 3.

Workstream 3 is led by Matthew Bauer, which is Additional Equity and Closing a Skills Gap Concentration.

So Matthew, please take it away.

MEMBER BAUER: Hello, and thank you, Robert. On behalf -- I have a few thank you's to start, and on behalf of Workstream 3, I'd like to thank Chairwoman Rosenworcel for the opportunity to serve and the Commissioners Carr, Starks, and Simington for your support and comments this morning.

To our CEDC Chair, Heather Gate. To our Vice Chair, Susan Au Allen and Dr. Nicol

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Turner Lee, thank you for your leadership and all of your support. And especially to you, Chair Gate, I - you've given us some special help and support that really helped guide us. And thank you for your wisdom and the experience.

A big thank-you to our Innovation and Access Chair, Robert Brooks. It's nice to see you finally. And all of you. And Jamila Bess Johnson, safe to say we wouldn't have made it along the way without her commitment and steady hand. It's really been a pleasure.

And Diana Coho, thank you all, thank you for all your support as well.

Noting my colleagues here. You've heard their names, but you can't probably hear them enough. Eve Lewis, Edgar Class, Letecia Latino-van Splunteren, Dr. Dianne Lynch, Susan Corbett, Alicia Tambe, Dr. Jon Gant, Sherman Kizart, and Monica Desai.

The mission and vision of Innovation and Access Workstream 3 has been centered around a critical and urgent problem and opportunity as

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

our country faces a digital skills gap. And that really is affecting our competitiveness as a country and overall national security.

But I think most importantly and to our passion is leaving millions, tens of millions trapped in this digital divide of opportunity.

And as we have slipped to now 29th in the world on the digital workforce skills level, our team looked deeply into the issue which affects individuals in every community, across the country, as well as small and minority-owned businesses and community-level organizations.

As over a third of our workforce and up to a half in more challenged communities and communities of color do not have the requisite digital skills to compete in today's digital workplace. At the same time, though, employers are desperate to hire people with these skills.

So we have this moment in time and opportunity that was talked about earlier to lift up millions of people around the country into new careers, increase household incomes, and create

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

more stable futures.

So as diving into our mission/vision goals, Robert had already touched on the description of what we're doing. So our goal was really to provide information and model resources that can help us down this path and increase educational employment and entrepreneurial opportunities.

Our action items that we set out were to conduct research and host a public convening and draft interim and final reports. So simply put on the next slide, what we have delivered is we had an amazing town hall and symposium in the fall of last year.

We had over 30 national and international leaders and speakers probably getting together something like that for the first time where all those voices could be heard in the fairly siloed, lots of great intentions but very siloed efforts around digital upscaling.

And that created this amazing and rich transcript, hundreds of pages, that we have been

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

distilling and trying to compact down into our interim report and as well as our final report. And those are towards a digital national upskilling program.

And that effort we were I think hoping to have something start on that in this first go-around, but we see that's going to take a lot more work. And hoping that that can be tackled, and that's part of our recommendations in the next phase of this work.

So I'm presenting today alongside my colleagues Dr. Dianne Lynch and Susan Corbett. If you could come online, and then Letecia Latino-van Splunteren next to me here.

And now to provide highlights of her final report, I'm excited to turn it over to Dr. Lynch, President of Stephens College. Please take it away, Dianne.

MEMBER LYNCH: Thank you, Matt. Good morning. I trust you can hear me. It is such a privilege to be with you here today, even virtually. And I'm so sorry now, because I now

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

recognize I'm missing my graduation ceremony.

(Laughter.)

(Simultaneous speaking.)

MEMBER LYNCH: Next slide, please. As you can see on the slide, the table of contents of our report. And I know that many of you had an opportunity to at least review some of it in advance. So I'm not going to belabor its fine points or even all of its individual recommendations, because there are many.

But I want to take a few minutes today to highlight some of its key takeaways. Our goal from the beginning has been to capture the best thinking and the insights of those people doing this amazing work on the ground and to provide it in a useful, practical, and focused way to those across the country who are just beginning this journey.

The state offices, writing and finalizing their digital equity plans, the community leaders motivated by time and opportunity to join the effort.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

We hope our readers will find that it provides a framework and a way of thinking about how to begin, how to proceed, and how to succeed in working with communities to meet their goals and achieve their aspirations for success.

While there's a lot of operational advice in the report, I highly recommend to all of you, I begin today at the beginning, recognizing that change is motivated by agency.

We listened and heard so many experts and advocates reminding us in ways large and small that a successful program to close the digital divide starts by meeting people where they are. It became one of our mantras. And my new one after this morning is that we all do better when we all do better. That also applies.

Our report acknowledges that when time is short and challenge is great, we as humans tend to push to find the straightest and quickest path from start to finish.

In my words only, top-down direction is so much easier than bottom-up consensus

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

building. But we also know that big change requires full ownership, and that every community has different needs, values, and cultural operating assumptions.

So we started with that. Meet people where they are. Listen instead of talking. In the words of Dr. Jon Gant, don't helicopter in. Don't assume that experience in one community will produce cookie cutter solutions for another.

We also realized and were told repeatedly that change never stops. Closing the digital divide is not a project or an event. It is a process and a framework to meet community needs today, tomorrow, and going forward.

Like from now on, just imagine what's about to happen with AI. Programs and systems established with today's funding must be sustainable to warrant and generate continued and future funding. And that means they must be built from start upon a system of data collection, clear metrics, and constant measurement.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

And finally, we know that the most efficient, effective, and sustainable solution will balance that requirement for local ownership and agency with the need to create an efficient, scalable, transparent, and collaborative national system, one that avoids duplication and establishes shared practices to support sustainability.

Our report asks you to consider whether federal or local incentives could motivate the private sector, including corporate employers, higher education institutions like mine, and foundations to embed digital skills training and inclusion resources in their operations.

We suggest that the solution to digital equity might rest in community-based networks, considering not only access to broadband connectivity devices, but also the skills to use them effectively. And it offers multiple practice-based recommendations to eliminate barriers, to encourage investment and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

participation, and to build community trust.

The plan also includes multiple appendices designed to provide readers with tools, examples, and guidance as they work to create their own digital equity and inclusion plans and projects.

They included digital equity and inclusion plan checklist, summaries of the digital equity upscaling program at Meta, Microsoft, and Charter Communications, the bios of the participating workgroup members, and a short bibliography of useful references and resources, which we are sure will continue to grow.

In summary, our report asserts that we cannot leave one person behind as we navigate the digital world.

And that means we must meet people where they are, support each community in identifying its own goals and solutions, and building a system of shared knowledge, experience, and collaboration across a national

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

network of sustainable, metrics-bounded and outcomes-based opportunities to upskill and to welcome every individual as fully participating members of our digital world.

Finally, my own couple of thanks, and I know this is - we're all so thankful. And I know I speak for our entire group when I take a moment to acknowledge and thank our fearless leader, Jamila Bess Johnson, who is better than anybody - I'm an academic, so I've seen a lot of people guiding a lot of opinionated people.

And I have never seen anybody do it better at guiding and leading this group of strong, and yes, opinionated volunteers with such nuance and grace.

More times that I can count she pulled us away from yet another rabbit hole or distraction and kept us on our path forward, teaching us along the way everything we needed to know about FCC protocol and policy.

In the words of Commissioner Rosenworcel, we wouldn't be graduating today with

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

our report as our diploma without your support and leadership, Jamila. So thank you.

And finally, we want to thank the Commissioner for the opportunity to dig deep, to be purposeful, and to understand the barriers that so many people across our nation face every day.

We will achieve digital equity and close the digital divide when all individuals and communities have the information technology capacity needed for full participation in our society, democracy, and economy.

Our working group realized in ways immediate and pressing that we can and must do more. And we share the opportunity now to get the work done. We hope we've been able to contribute in some small way to achieving that end.

Thank you, and I now turn this over to my amazing colleague, Susan Corbett.

MEMBER CORBETT: Well, good morning, everyone, and thank you, Dianne, and thanks,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Matt. It's a pleasure to be here with all of you and to be presenting with my esteemed colleagues.

Next slide, please.

So the Workstream 3 did an amazing job of pulling together recommendations and suggestions to go forward. We would really like our report to be shared with NTIA and other federal government and agency stakeholders so that we're all on the same page and working in the same direction to help close the digital divide across the country.

We would like to form a digital -- national digital skills strategy, which would -- and in that process we would create a CEDC task force and working group, which would include representatives from other agencies and organizations.

We have an overarching mission that follows the recommendation of the Workstream 3 final report. We'd like to help create a framework that can be shared across the country.

We'd like a common asset mapping inventory so

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

that we can see all of the great work that's going on across the country by so many organizations.

We seek additional comments on a potential national digital upscaling plan as per the notice to the digital discrimination and the NPRM. We'd like to aggregate best practices from state digital equity plans into digital skills strategy into final recommendations.

As many of you are aware, all of our states are working on state digital equity plans, and we'd like our work to be included in those plans as they move forward.

We'd like to determine the metrics and measurement recommendations, the goals for the BEAD and the DEA funding. And ensure that providers are familiar with the plan, its goals, and create ways that can support the overall digital upskilling effort.

The FCC should adopt digital upskilling strategies that are affected in the following areas. Meet people where they are and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

build trust in the community. Utilize traditional media to reach under-represented groups. Overcome systemic barriers and emphasis sustainability through collaboration. And measure outcomes and establish metrics.

It has been my pleasure to work with our Workstream 3 and to get to these recommendations vision of going forward.

I'd like to now turn it over to my colleague, Letecia Latino, and next slide, please.

MEMBER LATINO-VAN SPLUNTEREN: Thank you, Susan. And before I start, I also want to recognize besides all the echoes of, you know, all the people that have worked tirelessly, our leader, Matthew.

I mean, it's been an amazing working group to be part of. By you know, just listening, by Dianne, and Susan, you can feel the spirit of this working group. It has been fantastic.

So just in closing because Matthew

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

insisted that, you know, I also said a few words, but I think, you know, I don't want to be repetitive, but we, our working group wants to, you know, emphasize our recommendation for the Commission, you know, to focus on, you know, mapping the assets that are there.

Being, you know, the ACP outreach, an excellent example of what can be achieved. There's over ten million households that we have reached with that program. So you know sometimes when we put a task and we have a task ahead of us we think we have to reinvent the wheel.

There was a consistent subject all throughout our subject matter experts. It was, you know, map the assets. I think, or we think we are connectors of information, each one of us here. You know, as Henry said, I hope that report or those resources don't get lost. That's the biggest fear.

We have put an incredible amount of work, you know, out there. And our mission is, you know, to help the SEC however we can to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

reemphasize this messaging of meet people where they are. You know, utilize traditional media.

If we're trying to solve the digital divide, we cannot rely on, you know, electronic and the internet. We need to put boots on the ground, engage local communities, and just go to the traditional way, maybe, knocking door on door. You know, using newspapers, etc. Everything that we had said.

So we really believe that that should be the focus on, you know, creating awareness. All I was honored to chair the Job and Skills and Training Working Group for the BDAC.

And after two years of work, we all got to the same, you know, conclusion is we need to raise awareness. We need to have, you know, a unified strategy and we need to put the same word out so that we can reach the people we need to reach.

So thank you very much, and it has been an honor to be part of this working group. Matthew.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

MEMBER BAUER: Thank you, Letecia.
Thanks, Susan. Thanks, Dr. Lynch.

And I just want to put a exclamation and a point on what Dr. Lynch said. We can, must do more. And we hope we've been able to contribute some of the momentum around that. There's 50 organizations in every, you know, there's one in every state right now that are diving deep in this.

I'm part of the one in Colorado as well. And see all the work that's going on. So we truly have a moment in time. And a lot, for a long time a lot of the focus was, you know, dig the pipes and they will come and things will happen.

But there's so much more that needs to go on that's been highlighted by what you've heard this morning, not just from our workstream, but also No. 2 as well. And so we really hope that this retains and becomes part of the focal, you know, lens that is about, you know, erasing the digital divide.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

So thank you all and I will hand it back to you, Chair Brooks.

MEMBER BROOKS: All right, thank you, Matthew. Thank you, Workstream 3. Thank you to all presenters from Workstream 3.

I mentioned they put in a ton of work. For everything that they've -- that you guys saw today and heard.

I do want to open it up for questions.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: I have a question. Okay.

MEMBER BROOKS: I didn't know that's what that was for. Okay.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: Oh, yes, I mean I'm just using this because this will make me louder. So again, thank you to this workstream for the incredible work that you've done and some of the very bold and audacious recommendations.

My question to you is what would you recommend to this committee, particularly in the presence of our chairwoman and our DFOs, that we -- where do we send this?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

So is this something that we need to package up as a recommendation to go to the committee responsible for the broadband outreach work here at the Commission?

Or is this something that we need to package up -- I winced at the words AI hope that they will see it@ and would like to put an affirmative statement that this report will go to specific actors and agencies that are actually doing this work, i.e., you know, are you recommending that we send it to NTIA, care of the people who are ensuring that the statutory requirement of workforce actually gets fulfilled as part of the broadband equity funds being disbursed.

So we'd like to put that on record as to where these reports should go, Madam Chairwoman.

Maybe a question to you, Robert, as well, if you all have thought about who specifically should be hand-delivered these reports as well.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

MEMBER BAUER: Thank you, Dr. Turner Lee. Always poignant questions from you. We did talk about this and we -- it was, you know, we went as far as, you know, the design of forming, you know, sort of a cross-department, you know, committee that would work, you know, with Department of Labor and NTIA and FCC and so on.

But stopping short of that, I think that was one of Jamila and Heather's, you know, when they were reigning us back in to focus on what we had provided as our end deliverable. But clearly NTIA was at the top of the list. We didn't get to the specificity of who there should receive it.

But clearly there and Department of Labor was at the top of the list. And Letecia might have some thoughts on that, as she was part of the group she mentioned earlier. So I'll quickly pass to her as well.

I think it does make sense to potentially, you know, the 50 state organizations that are -- now the NTIA might be, you know, the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

world is kind of gray to me.

That might be better coming from them since they already have all those channels set up. But it might be very interesting for the FCC to sort of be more of convener here in this -- on this issue.

There's a lot of opportunity. I think there's a bit of a vacuum that exists. And maybe that's the first thing, you know, phase two of this group would pick up if we continue.

I don't know, Letecia, do you have any?

MEMBER LATINO-VAN SPLUNTEREN: Yes, I'll just add I think I was recently also part of the Telecommunications Interagency Working Group.

And I believe that, you know, that interagency collaboration is key, it was part of our recommendations. So every agency I believe has to have a copy of this report.

And then we are living an historic moment as the -- each state is forming broadband offices. I personally in Florida have formed

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

relationships, you know, with the broadband office. And they are very grateful when I pass on all these public reports that, you know, sometimes get lost.

So I personally believe that every single broadband office in every state should receive this report. Because it will be very helpful and it would help us all align, you know, the message and the strategy.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: Madam Chairwoman, I'd like to put a recommendation as a follow-up, that these recommendations, and it may apply to all the groups that we hear from, have definitive exit points to the appropriate leaders within the relevant agencies receive this.

Particularly we develop working with our DFOs a way to guarantee that those documents are delivered to NTIA, Department of Labor, etc., at the end of this meeting. And that it's placed on record that they will be delivered.

CHAIR GATE: Thank you, Nicol. Got that on record.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

I just wanted to thank you again. This has been a wonderful experience participating in all your planning meetings. One thing I wanted to get on the record was that the town hall meeting and the digital skills event symposium that was hosted in September, it wasn't -- it was during -- the timing was there for a reason.

That was the time when the NTIA was scheduled to start announcing the state planning -- digital equity planning grants.

And so as my memory serves me, it was very strategic on your part to timing it, to time it at that time and to bring together stakeholders and really have this public discussion about digital skilling as the states were beginning to get into the process of planning.

So I applaud you for that, thinking strategically about timing and facilitating a conversation on this awesome platform that the FCC allowed us to be on.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

But I also, I also wanted to recognize the time and effort and the follow-up discussions. I know we had to say stop talking to those people so much.

But, you know, you all's strategy of bringing people to the table at the beginning of planning process and then conducting follow-up interviews and discussions with people to see their mindsets as they started engaging in the actual planning process was pretty darn wonderful to me. So thank you for that.

So I just wanted to get that on the record because I listened when I came to your meetings of how you all were engaging with stakeholders and really trying to meet people where they are. You not only wrote about it, but you lived it in your outreach efforts. So thank you.

MEMBER BAUER: Thank you, thank you, Chair Gate. And I would just -- the transcript that came out of this, you know, might be part of what is delivered. It's beefy.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

But it is, you know, when we started to try and condense it, it was very difficult to decide what to chop because there was so much amazing information in this -- in that event that came out of that event.

And so to the effect that that is also part of what goes out I think folks, you know, could really take probably other things than even what we've highlighted so far. So I would keep that as part of the package. Thank you.

MEMBER BROOKS: Are there any more questions or comments for Workstream 3?

CHAIR GATE: Anything online? No.

MEMBER BROOKS: All right, well, thank you, Workstream 3, for your presentation. I'd like to also thank just on behalf of the entire working group the FCC Chairwoman Rosenworcel, Commissioners, DFOs, CEDC Chairs.

Personally and specifically, Jamila, immensely. Thank you so much for your help, guidance on everything.

Susan, I definitely need to thank you

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

too. When we first started this you spent a lot of hours talking to me over the phone, getting me prepped. And toward the end of it, you know, we had another conversation. And knowing that you were very willing to express whatever you have to say.

For a fact, I was getting emails every other week like you're doing this wrong. I was like, thank you so much.

You know, so, and what that said to the members specifically of Workstream -- of the working group. You know, a lot of people, you know, made this a really good experience. You know, Matthew, Letecia, Charles, Joycelyn, I can really go through the whole list. Steven, you know, the St. Louis connection with Steven was great.

Overall, as well as even Howie learned he was from Buffalo and Skip, you know, knowing that you worked in Buffalo. You know, so it's like, it was really good. It made things a lot - - very personal, and I'm just glad we were able

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

to get to this point of completion.

And I'd like to say to everybody in the working group we can finally breathe, get some sleep. And I want to conclude it from there, so.

(Off-microphone comments.)

MEMBER BROOKS: Yeah, hopefully everybody's coming back. Yeah, I'm planning on coming back.

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: We are all coming back. This is only halfway, halftime. Nobody can inherit and take the ball, take it to the end and put it in a hole. And so we are all coming back.

MEMBER BROOKS: Sounds good, that works. With that said, give the floor back to Heather, and thank you again.

CHAIR GATE: Thank you. Thank you, Robert. I just want to thank you specifically again. It is very exciting that the FCC accepted new and young blood to come in and start having - - being part of this conversation.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

So I'm excited to see you continue to return to the platform and just bring the fresh perspective that is much needed in the platform.

So on that note, are you ready to submit your motion?

MEMBER BROOKS: Yes. Okay, so I need some help with this. How would I say this? I'm going to say it publicly.

PARTICIPANT: I move to submit our report and findings.

MEMBER BROOKS: Okay, I move to submit our report and findings to this committee for approval.

CHAIR GATE: Do I have a second? I do.

PARTICIPANT: Second, second.

CHAIR GATE: Thank you. Thank you, Steven.

PARTICIPANT: All in favor, aye.

CHAIR GATE: So let me go ahead and just, I'm going to seek unanimous consent and ask for objections. So what we're going to do, we're

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

going to do it for each workstream individually.

And I'll do it really quickly.

So as far as Workstream 2, Access to Capital, they are submitting the following recommendations to the SEC to develop an outreach and public awareness campaign that targets women and minorities with information about the Office of Communications Business Opportunity's role in promoting participation of small businesses, women, and minorities in the communication industry.

Number two, discuss with congressional leaders the desirability, size, and structure of our broadcast diversity fund to boost small and women-led minority -- minority organizations. Urge Congress to adopt legislation to restore and update the tax certification (audio interference).

Urge Congress to pass the Broadcast VOICES Act. And spearhead the planning of our interagency task force that (audio interference.) with federal agencies with regulatory

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

jurisdiction over issues impacting small minority and women-led businesses, including those issues pertaining to loans, guarantees, and federal advertising contracts and expenditures.

So I'm seeking unanimous consent, and therefore request that anyone with any objection and wish to abstain, speak now or forever hold your peace. Give you ten more seconds.

Great. So the work of Access to Capital Workstream 2 as part of Innovation and Access, is adopted. Congratulations.

(Applause.)

CHAIR GATE: Okay, so the recommendations for Workstream 3. They recommend that the FCC share the reports entitled America's Digital Transformation: Urgent National Priority and Opportunity: Digital Upskilling with NTIA and other federal government and agency stakeholders.

They also recommend that the FCC create a formalized national digital skills strategy through rechartering of a CEDC working group to work on that.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

They also recommend that the FCC adopt digital upskilling strategies that are effective in the following areas. Meeting people where they are and building trust in the community. Utilizes traditional media to reach under-represented groups. Overcome systematic barrier and emphasis sustainability through collaboration. And measure outcome and establish metrics.

Okay, I also will seek unanimous consent. And any objectors or anyone who wishes to abstain speak now or, give you time. Nothing from the -- nothing online? Okay. Passes unanimously. Congratulations again to Innovation Access.

(Applause)

CHAIR GATE: Thank you so much. And on that note, we'll go to break. And we are very grateful to Edgar and Wiley for lunch. We appreciate you. Anybody who provides us lunch is a friend to all.

Please return at 12:50, 12:50. And

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

for those that are online, if you can stay on, do not log out, we will do roll call so that we can vote again in the afternoon for the other two working groups.

So please be back on time so we can establish quorum before we pick up again at one o'clock.

So thank you, everyone.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair Gate. And we're going to try to take a quick group photo before you all get your sandwiches. So if everyone could go up to the dais there.

(Whereupon, the above-entitled matter went off the record at 12:05 p.m. and resumed at 1:16 p.m.)

A-F-T-E-R-N-O-O-N S-E-S-S-I-O-N

(1:16 p.m.)

CHAIR GATE: Good afternoon. Good afternoon, everyone. Thank you. Welcome back and thank you very much once again to Wiley for the wonderful lunch.

And, Edgar, we really appreciate you doing this, giving us the much-needed networking opportunity that we have not had for a whole two years. So, thank you again.

(Applause.)

CHAIR GATE: And now, we're going to continue with our Working Group briefings. And next up is Chris Wood with the Diversity and Equity Working Group.

So, Chris is participating virtually.

Chris, if you can unmute and take the floor?

MEMBER C. WOOD: Good afternoon. Thank you so much, Heather.

I'm sorry I couldn't be there in person. As most people know, June is Pride Month

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

and --

CHAIR GATE: Hey, Chris, we can't hear you.

MEMBER C. WOOD: I'm speaking. I'm off mute. Can you hear me? Can you hear me now?

CHAIR GATE: We can hear you now, yes. Thank you.

MEMBER C. WOOD: Thank you so much for having me here today, and sorry I couldn't be there in person. As most of you know, June is Pride Month and I am stretched all over the country working on behalf of my organization, LGBT Tech. So, I'm so sorry I couldn't be there with you all today.

First and foremost, I would like to thank you, Heather. Thank you for your leadership and for all of your work over the past two years. I know it has not come without a lot of work and a lot of effort from our leadership, as well as all the tireless hours and meetings, many of which you were in.

I'd also like to extend a very welcome

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

thank you to Chairwoman Rosenworcel, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Starks, and Commissioner Simington for their comments earlier today.

I also would like to say thank you so much to our Designated Federal Officer, Jamila Bess Johnson, and her deputies. Over the entire time -- I know that we're closing out with Diana -- and Diana was so helpful in ensuring that all of the work put in by my group came together, and Ashley for sitting in when Jamila and Diana couldn't be there.

I would also be remiss if I didn't say thank you to Keyla Hernandez, who was with us in the beginning of this and who also put in a lot of hours before taking a different position within the FCC.

Thank you, also, to Nicol Turner Lee and to Susan Allen for your steadfast leadership and working so tirelessly with us both and ensuring that all of this came together in so many ways.

I think it would be remiss if I didn't

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

also just say again and started this meeting with saying happy Pride Month. Visibility is extremely important. And as the Chairwoman said earlier, that visibility and that participation in our systems is extremely important.

And so, whether you identify with the LGBT community or any other community within the United States, I strongly encourage you to get involved in civil service, research, education, or within companies that are leading a lot of these technologies.

Because, as you will see from my presentation, we really tried to reach into these communities and talk to those leaders that are working, maybe not at a federal level, maybe they're working at a regional level or maybe they're working at a local level. And their voices are so important because they're doing the work on the ground, where it is absolutely crucial to ensure the access and equity and diversity within so many of these sectors, but, mostly, ensure that we all have equitable access

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

to the digital space and the digital world.

Next slide, please.

The group of individuals that came together to work on my Working Group over the past two years put in so much time and effort -- from digital discrimination to many of the other topics that we talked about today, that we're going to talk about today -- ensuring that access is equitable, but, also, that we're listening to our communities and ensuring that we're hearing how these community leaders are pulling themselves up by their bootstraps.

So many of you all really took time and effort to drive and ensure that we were reaching out to those who were doing things in a unique fashion, working with nontraditional anchor institutions -- anchor institutions being the backbone of what so many of these communities rely on. So, whether it's a community center, a church, an LGBTQ center, a program that's running and ensuring individuals are getting into STEAM fields, these areas are so important, and this

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

group really came together to make sure that we were hearing from them all over the country.

And so, I want to thank each and every single one of these: Nahuja, Tony, Charlyn, Skip, James, Jill, Melody, Rosa, Dr. Johnson, Brian, Brigitte, Cathy, Ellen, Faith, Jenna, Mona, Otto, and Randi. All of you came together in so many ways.

And I especially thank each of you that stepped up into leadership positions to help pull this together. It was a lot of work to do.

It was a lot of work to make sure we were reaching people and meeting them where they are.

And so, I thank each one of you for the many phone calls, the many meetings, the planning meets, the symposiums that were pulled together, because that is what pulled together this amazing work today.

I would also be remiss if I didn't just take a moment to thank Nicol, Dr. Nicol Turner Lee. She has been a steadfast mentor of mine for many years on so many different levels,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

but, in particular, her knowledge and her breadth of everything that's happening in this space is so important, and her ability to bring that all together, not only from the perspective of what she works in, but the communities that she talks to all over the country is extremely important.

And so, I want to take a special moment and thank Nicol for all of your help in pulling this together, for really working with the entire team, and ensuring that we were putting together a report of things that were actionable and things that the FCC can truly take to the next level, not only within the FCC, but, hopefully, across different government agencies.

Next slide, please.

We really wanted to make sure that we were looking at the underrepresentation, underemployment, and challenges faced by so many individuals across the country, especially as we are really entering new worlds of digital space.

As I heard the other day, it took almost 30 years for some of the first digital

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

platforms to reach 10 million users. It took social media platforms, some of the most popular out there, to reach 10 million users in about 10 years. And most recently, the adoption of AI and ChatGPT, it took about six months to go to 10 million users. So, if that doesn't underscore how fast technology is moving, I'm not sure what else would.

And so, it's important that we were encouraging participation from groups around the country and really understanding how these communities were diving into their different perspectives, their different societal makeups, and their different regions to make sure that people are learning new skills, developing new opportunities, advancing their technical skills, and upskilling -- but not just reaching individuals that we have in the past, but people of color, women, people with disabilities, veterans, those living on tribal lands, LGBTQ, and so many others that may have not necessarily had the same opportunities as others have in the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

past.

I'm so encouraged by the work done both on this group and the work before this group was formed in the previous iteration, but also the leadership of the FCC and the leadership of those individuals sitting around the table today and online who have worked so hard in these spaces -- making sure that we're including not only industry, but we're including government, nonprofit sectors, and for-profit sectors to address these inequalities in the workplace and ensure that not only the technology is keeping up with it, but the policies and the programs are.

What you'll hear today is truly an underscore of the highlight of the best practices, things that can be adapted from programs that may not necessarily fit the mold, but, most certainly, have reached a group of individuals; have pushed in driving different perspectives in STEAM fields, different perspectives in fields that are so important to the makeup of the United States, and quite

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

frankly, the global economy.

I think it's also important on this score that we need to continue to push additional diversity in STEAM fields or STEM fields. At LGBT Tech, we use STEAM because we recognize that arts are a part of the design process.

And so, I truly ask that the work doesn't stop today, and that the work that is presented today is just a stepping stone, as it has been for so long in this diversity committee, and that we continue to build on it. Because, as I said earlier, technology is continuing to evolve at a pace that I think is even hard for us in the field to keep up with.

And so, I encourage the FCC, I encourage those civil society leaders and business leaders sitting around the table today and online and listening to continue to push and drive the recommendations that we're presenting today.

With that, I would like to go ahead and advance to the next slide, and I would like

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

to turn it over to Tony, who took over and really led, in conjunction with Rose Mendoza, Workstream 2, around digital upskilling and the future of work.

Tony?

MEMBER TIJERINO: Thank you, Chris.

I would say I was propped by Chris and Rosa Mendoza more than leading anything. And I can't tell you how much I appreciate it, Chris.

And it's Pride year around, and thank you for highlighting it during this month, but it's year around.

Also, just a special thank you to Jessica Rosenworcel and the team -- Jamila, Diana, Keyla before -- and all the Chairs. Really appreciate everything that you all have done in terms of your leadership. You were hands-on, probably more hands-on than you wanted to be. But I really appreciate how we had some adaptability that we had to deal with within our group, and you handled it with grace and being constructive the entire time, even when you were

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

challenging us.

The Workstream, it's Digital Upskilling and the Future. This Workstream addresses the job opportunity gap faced by many Americans, particularly within the underrepresented communities, and steps key industries, nonprofit, government stakeholders can take to create economic mobility and empowerment that will benefit our country and all communities.

And it's really important, when we talk about upskilling, it's not simply being in a better position, in a better job. It is actually changing the course of your community, as an individual, and then, your entire families in terms of economic mobility. It is at the core of it, and often, it's left out of issues of community development.

So, let me go to the next.

So, they key findings were:

The state of the labor market. There is an increasing demand for tech-related jobs.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Creative recruitment methods, providing training to individuals without a college degree were recommended to address workforce challenges.

And we wanted to make sure that we went to non-anchor institutions and really leveraged -- and I have to tell you, Anisa is here, who did a great job as part of the panel, but we really wanted to make sure that we have buy-in from the private sector. Because they have a big stake in all of this, especially as we're moving your workforces through. She did an excellent job as a part of the panel.

Upskilling for new technology jobs. Creating solutions, such as upskilling programs and public-private partnerships, can help ensure individuals, especially those without a college degree, who are prepared, for future job opportunities.

Three, opportunities in the digital marketplace. Partnerships between industry, academia, government, and local community leaders is critical to tailor workforce development

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

programs to community needs.

And four, it is social infrastructure and ecosystems for worker involvement. Educational institutions, community organizations, and non-traditional anchor institutions are important partners for addressing the digital divide and providing equitable access to training.

With that, I am going to turn it over to Jenna.

MEMBER ALSAYEGH: Thank you so much, Tony.

Next slide, please.

So, we identified four recommendations.

The first is for the FCC to consider nontraditional anchor institutions as important partners in developing digital upskilling initiatives and achieving the goal of universal connectivity.

These institutions, like health clinics or faith-based organizations, are working

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

directly with people on the ground and understand the specific needs of their communities. So, having these relationships can help increase the agency's ability to really meet those communities where they are and provide the best resources that can make the biggest difference.

We also encouraged the FCC to share our report with NTIA and to communicate regularly about the best practices outlined in our report to help with their efforts with universal connectivity.

Our second recommendation is for the FCC to formalize a Working Group on Digital Training. This Working Group should focus on understanding what local leaders and organizations from across the country are doing to ensure their communities have the opportunity to participate in upskilling programs.

Another key takeaway from one of our panel discussions was the importance of raising awareness of future-of-work opportunities as early as the K-through-12 level. So, we hope

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

that this Working Group would explore how to make digital training available for people of all ages. Because we've learned that we'll have the biggest impact on diversifying the talent pipeline and creating a future high school workforce.

Next slide, please.

Our third recommendation is that FCC should maintain an inventory of industry training resources and programs that advance workforce opportunities for underrepresented populations. We learned about some great partnership models between government, industry, and academia. For example, Miami-Dade County examines what jobs employers are looking to fill, and then, works with universities to create programming to teach the necessary skills for those jobs.

In Ohio, the Governor's Office of Workforce Transformation is also working with industry and local universities to raise awareness of job opportunities in the broadband industry and launched training programs to ensure

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

the State has a prepared and skilled telecommunications workforce.

We also heard repeatedly how the Affordable Connectivity Program has been a successful partnership between government and industry to expand access to the connectivity that is necessary for people to participate in these workforce development programs. So, these partnerships can be replicated in other states and local communities.

And gathering these examples from diverse stakeholders and keeping them in a centralized place will help us better understand the successful models and, also, help us advance our efforts to improve the training ecosystem for everyone.

Our fourth recommendation is that the FCC should develop formal alliances with organizations that have deep roots and relationships with Hispanic, tribal, Asian American, African American, older American, LGBTQ-plus, those with disabilities, and other

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

underrepresented communities to help with pipeline concerns in the broadband and tech sectors.

We've learned that these organizations can help us understand the unique needs of each community, so we can tailor broadband and tech training programs to engage as many people as possible. The other great thing is that they can provide another avenue for sharing information and raise more awareness about the training opportunities that are available to them.

So, with that, thank you. And now, I'll hand it over to the Co-Lead for Workstream 3, Aama Nahuja.

MEMBER NAHUJA: Thanks, Jenna.

And thank you, Antonio. That was a great report.

And before I move on, I also wanted to thank Jamila Bess Johnson, Diana Coho, and Ashley Tyson, and also, the CED Chairs, Heather Gate, Nicol Turner Lee, and Susan Allen for helping us along this two-year journey.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

And finally, I also want to thank Chris Wood. We call him "our fearless leader," who chaired our industry Diversity and Equity Working Group.

Good afternoon. I'm Aama Nahuja, General Counsel at Wonder Media Company, which includes American Urban Radio Network and Superadio.

Our other Co-Chairs are Charlyn Stanberry and Melody Spann Cooperation. We also had other members on our group: Cathy Schubert and Mona Thompson. Many of our members were on a lot of different Working Groups and Working Streams, but, nonetheless, they were absolutely extraordinary for Workstream 3.

But we also depended on contributions from other Working Groups to help us get our work done, to support our presentation at our March 6th Forum, and to provide critical informational context for our report for you today.

Next slide, please.

The Digital Empowerment Working Group

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

shared with us the best practices that states and localities are using today to preclude digital discrimination by broadband internet service providers, especially with underserved populations.

And the Innovation and Access Working Group mapped out for us how diverse small and medium-sized businesses could prevent discrimination against them in accessing the JOBS Act loans and grant award process.

But Workstream 3 built on this knowledge to take a granular approach. We challenged ourselves to expand the definition of anchor institutions by identifying even smaller businesses and organizations, ones addressing needs in their professions, communities, and populations, and whose potential institutional investment in the JOBS Act Digital Equitable Planning and Workforce Development was really worth highlighting for everyone.

We found in our deep dive that many organizations are on a path that is creating a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

paradigm shift in how to target underserved populations. These non-traditional anchor institutions are highly-trusted, constituency-focused, community-based and cultural organizations.

Unfortunately for their communities and for funders, they were virtually unknown as anchor institutions. Many of them were community-based nonprofits, LGBTQIA nonprofits, faith-based nonprofits, and other senior organizations, among others. These nontraditional organizations with which we communicated shared with us programming design to embrace diversity, inclusion, and equity in the workforce.

Our Co-Chairs, who are Charlyn and Melody, will share information on Workstream 3's journey during the two-year CED charter process.

Please move to the next slide, and I'm going to turn that over to Charlyn.

MEMBER STANBERRY: Hi, everyone.

As my good Co-Lead Aama Nahuja

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

mentioned, my name is Charlyn Stanberry. I work for the National Association of Broadcasters.

But I also just want to say it's been such a pleasure working with everyone, particularly Aama and Melody, because they are awesome, and they really believe in the mission when we're talking about nontraditional anchor institutions.

So, during our first year, there are a couple of things that we did to put into focus how we were going to evaluate and talk about and get more information on these institutions. So, we honed-in on what our forum focus would be.

Our focus was to identify government and private organizations to connect with unknown and underfunded organizations developing digital technologies and skills in underserved populations who are digitally-underserved.

With that focus, then we moved into assembling a list. So, we had to do research in regard to what nontraditional anchor institutions are out there. What are the particular community

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

needs to empower representation and to create those solutions using their cultural assets to address obstacles that may include race, language, citizenship status, education, business sustainability in their communities?

So, one of the key things, when we were looking at the focus, was just trying to evaluate what obstacles also are there and what's hindering other organizations, such as like NTIA, or different groups from getting their profiles raised.

In the second year, what we did is we actually had to speak with some of our guest experts. So, on February 21st, we spoke with our first one, which was Diversify Architecture. It's located in Raleigh, North Carolina. And basically, they spoke with us about how they are a nontraditional anchor institution; how they have created a voluntary curriculum that's affiliated with their local schools and cultural organizations that targets junior through high school, postgraduate to getting an architecture

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

license.

On February 26th, we were able to speak with the Hurston Institute for Learning and Development, which is based out of Minneapolis, Minnesota. And this organization identifies, like, how do you target your oldest child, for a spread into the siblings, getting involved in STEM activities and associations that are dedicated and critical for additional in-tech career or work path options?

Now, I'd like to give it to my good colleague, Melody Spann Cooper, to talk about the fireside chat that we had.

MEMBER SPANN COOPER: Thank you so much, Charlyn.

And I cannot say enough about the work that you and Nahuja did. I've got to tell you, quite honestly, I spent a lot of time on Workstream 4 and very little time on Workstream 3, and they took care of the business. So, thank you so much.

I did have an opportunity to sit down

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

with an incredible professor, Dr. Jon Gant, out of North Carolina. And it was a short, yet powerful, conversation on nontraditional anchor institutions. And some of the key takeaways from our conversations included he highlighted the cultural and educational reach of HBCUs. He addressed and shared tried actions and suggested partnership methods for bridging the current and future internet digital broadband divide.

He reviewed upskilling success and why it requires a strategy alignment with the mission of the organization solving problems systemically and investing resources and time for long-term goals to achieve real change in urban and rural digitally-underserved communities.

Dr. Gant, as you know, is a member of our team here. And he was fascinating. He's done a lot of work in this space. If you didn't get a chance to watch it live, I'd advise you to please visit the FCC website and see the interview. And he's got great work, also, on YouTube. I was really able to learn a lot more

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

about him.

Next slide, please.

And I think I'll turn it back over to Charlyn.

MEMBER STANBERRY: Thank you, Melody.

So, in addition to that wonderful fireside chat that we had, we also had a panel with our nontraditional anchor institutions just to kind of talk about an additional ecosystem forum.

So, on March 6th, also, that forum, we spoke with these organizations who are key in our states, that need to be considered for policy recommendations because they have a key focus area on meeting local digital needs. Some of them had obstacles and they were able to overcome those obstacles. So, it was really a good conversation in regards to best practices and, also, to talk to them and see what their needs are and how can the FCC and other organizations partner together and collaborate with them to make sure that those needs are met.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

So, I just want to highlight a couple of the organizations, just so that you can see the vast array and the variety and diversity in them.

We spoke with the Puede Network, based out of Dallas, Texas. We spoke with Adan Gonzalez.

Also, we spoke with the Change Agencies, and the person we connected with is Kristelle Siarza, who is founder of the Asian Business Collaborative and Siarza Advertising Firm, based out of Albuquerque, New Mexico.

In addition, we spoke with Dr. Fallon Wilson, who happens to be the Vice President of Policy for MMTTC, based out of Nashville, Tennessee. And she is affiliated with the Tennessee Future of Work Taskforce.

And also, Dr. Yolanda Majors, who is affiliated with the Hurston Institute for Learning and Development out of Minneapolis, Minnesota.

And then, Jake Heffington, Executive

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Director and Professor, based out of Raleigh, North Carolina, and his organization is Diversify Architecture.

So, as you can see, we had a variety of individuals we spoke with from nontraditional anchor institutions. And, you know, their findings were just what we thought they would be in regards to some recommendations they have about the FCC partnering with them, getting information out, and also, just having some type of conversation in regards to current FCC programs that they may be able to collaborate, apply for, or get the word out in their local communities.

Next slide, please.

And I'm going to turn it back over to my colleague, Aama Nahuja.

MEMBER NAHUJA: Thanks, Charlyn.

So, I can't really emphasize how impressed we all were when we listened to panel four and the other panels as well. And I just hope you were as moved by the breadth and the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

range of what these nontraditional anchor institutions were doing.

I hope the FCC and the CEDC is able to follow up on this insight opportunity and the connections that we've made.

Let me end by saying that I truly believe that all of us who are working for a better and more productive workforce can use the information shared today to ensure that the investments made in U.S. communities, especially through the JOBS Act, paves the way for a digital and tech workforce that will serve the U.S. well.

I will just finish with Workstream 3's recommendations.

Workstream 3 recommends that the FCC Office of Workplace Diversity should help develop formal alliances with these and other organizations that have deep roots and relationships within Hispanic, Asian American, Native American, African American, LGBTQ-plus, and other underrepresented communities, to help with pipeline concerns in the broadband and tech

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

sectors, as well as the FCC.

We also recommend these actions:

The FCC should continue to expand alliances with NGOs, nontraditional anchor institutions, and other community-based organizations, as outlined in the recommendations, to ensure the FCC has a clear understanding of the needs of these communities at all times and can call on these community sectors to share and disseminate information.

Additionally, the FCC should create and audit existing summer and year-long internships to ensure retention of students from diverse backgrounds.

This concludes Workstream 3's presentation, and it's now my pleasure to hand over the mic to Chris for questions and for introducing Workstream 4.

Thank you.

MEMBER C. WOOD: Thank you so much. I really appreciate it.

Charlyn and Melody, thank you so much

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

for your presentation.

I want to underscore the importance of this Working Group and, also, underscore that so many of these individuals, although they may have served on committees elsewhere or served on other Working Groups under maybe other agencies or within different institutions, so many of the members of my Working Group are new to the FCC, new to the FCC process.

And I think that brought a huge diversity to the work being done, but, also, looking at it through a different lens. I hope you see today that the efforts being brought forward, the groups that were presented/interviewed, and really looking at it in a different perspectives was really a charge from the Chairwoman, and has been a charge from the Chairwoman from the beginning of her tenure at the FCC -- ensuring that we're closing the homework gap; ensuring that we're looking not just at the problems of today, but where did those problems source from?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

And quite frankly, this group dug into that in a way that I'm so proud of. Even those who have been around the FCC for a while -- Rosa, Antonio -- also really took the perspective outside the box and really started looking at things from a different lens and ensuring that we're taking the most of the JOBS Act and ensuring that we were implementing and presenting something to the FCC that was new, different, but still within the purview of what they can do and how they can work across interagencies.

So, I want to underscore and thank you so much for all of your work, for putting in the hours, and ensuring that you brought this diversity and this diverse perspective to the FCC.

And to Nicol, again, thank you for helping us pull it all together because it doesn't always fit into the perfect box or square that maybe the FCC has traditionally worked in. And so, I really appreciate the leadership of Nicol, as well as other Chairs Susan and Heather,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

for helping us pull this together, and the guidance of the DFOs.

With that, I want to introduce Workstream 4, and I wanted to jump in here because Workstream 4 -- next slide, please -- Workstream 4 is really working around minority media and communications, tech ownership and development.

And the same thing here; although so many of these individuals may have worked around the FCC for a while, or they're working in this space that is impacted by the FCC, or really looks to the FCC for guidance on a lot of this, I want to commend them on the way they really thought about this in a new, expanded way.

And I'm really excited to turn it over to Melody Spann Cooper to present what we've found over the last two years.

MEMBER SPANN COOPER: Chris, thank you so much for the introduction and for all the work you did with our Workstream. You worked tirelessly, as did Jamila, as did Diana, as did

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Keyla before she left, and then, Erica. We could not have pulled this off without your dedication.

Also, I want to recognize Heather because many days we would turn on and she would be there. I don't know how she did it, but she did; and, of course, Sue Allen and Dr. Turner Lee, the girl I want to be when I grow up. Thank you so much, and to Chairwoman Rosenworcel and the rest of the Commissioners who have participated.

Our charge was to analyze how the FCC could better support minority ownership in media, communications, and technology, while exploring how the FCC can directly or indirectly support content creators or technology innovators. And we had a robust group of members. And I'm going to call them by name and their affiliation, and you'll see why it was really so robust, the conversations that we had over the past two years.

Starting with Ellen Schned, my Co-Lead, who is from the Strong Women Alliance,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

and she is just that.

And, of course, Skip Dillard, who is the king of New York radio, right, at Odyssey? And myself.

And then, our Workstream group members: Charlyn Stanberry from the National Association of Broadcasters; Jim Winston, our fierce leader at the National Association of Black Owned Broadcasters; Otto Padron, who has a powerful company, Hispanic-owned, Meruelo Media, out of California; and, of course, Faith Bautista, Faith, who has ChimeTV.

So, you can see the diversity of it and you can imagine the conversations we had on many of these issues over the past two years that centered, really, on three or four issues that just continued to come up.

Next slide, please.

And on February 7th, in this very room, we held a symposium, and we really went deep and analyzed those issues. And we started the morning off that day with Commissioner

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Starks, who gave some startling -- and I do mean really startling -- numbers that Skip will share with you.

And they were startling to me because I'm a second-generation media owner, and when my dad started our company maybe 30-40 years ago, I'm not sure that the numbers looked much different. I'm not sure, right?

But Commissioner Starks also shared a bright note: that we have to get out of a linear approach to media ownership. And Skip will share more of us insights on that.

Secondly, we dealt with the hurdles and opportunities in the media landscape.

And I have to acknowledge somebody else in the room, Pat Boyers, who's here, who is a media owner. For her to be here today speaks to how passionate and important these issues were, and how we really took charge of this.

She had an amazing conversation with DuJuan McCoy, who is also a powerful media owner.

The name of his company is leaving me now. But

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

their conversation on retrans was just amazing. When you see two practitioners come and be passionate, and on different ends of the spectrum, it was just great dialog.

We also talked about the importance of grooming the next generation of diverse media owners. Where will we get them from? Many of them are in places right now, in tech firms. They're in upper management, mid-tier management.

How do we groom them in these individual shops in order for them to become the next owner of a tech company, or a digital company, or a broadcast company?

And then, the 360-degree look at capital. We hear this all the time: access to capital; access to capital. So, we thought we would take it from a different approach. We not only looked at it from, you know, where do you get funds for acquisitions, but advertising, in the advertising world?

As you know, right after -- and Dr. Lee mentioned this -- post-George-Floyd, many of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

the advertising firms began to acknowledge that there is value in community, and they wanted to reach out. And the goal is to have them not only reach out two years ago, but to see if their commitment was a movement, that they planned to be here for the long haul.

And we had individuals from different advertising companies come and really speak to that level of investment in accessing capital.

So, those were our approaches to how we went about Workstream 4 and talking about equity and diversity. Our goal was to produce a full overview of that day. We have in recommendations to the FCC.

I am going to turn this over now to my other Co-Lead Skip Dillard, who will get more specific about our findings.

MEMBER DILLARD: Sure. Thank you, Melody. I really appreciate you and all of your leadership.

We were able to conduct a media symposium at FCC headquarters. We were so

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

excited when our "asks" were vetted and the calls went out. And I think what was most impressive were the number of people that felt this was important enough for them to get here to D.C. Everyone had a virtual option, but being that most wanted to be here at the Commission with us really inspired all of us to do the very best job we could to get as many questions asked as we could out of all of these experts and to record our findings.

This symposium, by the way, was here on February 7th, 2023. Owners and senior executives from radio, television, cable, and the technology gaming industry were in attendance, along with nonprofit media support groups.

The symposium consisted of over 30 in-person and online presenters and panelists; was attended by several dozen in-person guests, along with hundreds via Streamlink to the FCC website.

This diverse group of experts, public participants, and FCC officials debated multiple issues around media ownership affecting women and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

minorities. We conducted follow-up interviews and compiled summaries of our written report to the FCC from the data -- opinions and real-life scenarios faced by media, communications, and technology executives and owners.

The opening symposium commentary from FCC Commissioner Geoffrey Starks revealed some pretty startling facts in radio. With over 10,000 radio stations, 9 percent are female-owned; 2 percent Black-owned; 1 percent Asian-owned; 5 percent Latino-owned.

For full power TV, 5 percent owned by women; 3 percent Black-owned; 1 percent Asian-owned; 4 percent Latino.

Commissioner Starks' commented that we can no longer afford to look at the industry in a linear way, and that cable and streaming, along with other emerging technologies, are opening doors for new onboards -- providing more equity in ownership.

Some of our key findings:

Big companies, traditionally, have

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

preferred not doing deals with smaller companies.

This would probably be related to the fact that smaller companies may take longer to get access to the capital they need to complete a deal. They may need some seller financing and other things that a bigger company may not need.

The tech industry has little to no regulation, and they are the new monopoly, while broadcasters are often dealing with outdated regulation -- making it harder to compete in today's media and advertising environments.

Minority-owned broadcasters are not at parity with advertising dollars. Diverse owners offer an advantage with a broader perspective and an opportunity to effect change using their authentic voice to make a difference in their respective communities.

Panelists agreed that they are not seeking handouts; just a more level playing field.

The gaming industry, surprisingly, was a great space, we found, to expand minority

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

participation. Eighty-three percent of Blacks participate in some online, mobile, or gaming system play; yet, only 4 percent are actually part of the industry.

Education is the biggest takeaway in preparing the next generation of owners. Mentors are important, but sponsors are even more important today.

Next slide.

The NAB, National Association of Broadcasters' Broadcast Leadership Training Program, which I went through as well, is a big success for industry onboards. Fifty-nine participants in the program have actually become owners; 63 percent hold executive-level positions in radio, TV, and cable.

We also learned that the Minority Tax Certificate worked. It motivated big companies to seek out minorities and smaller companies to get ownership deals done.

Women in technology have little to no voice in an industry which is reflected in the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

low number of women technologists.

Smaller companies today face huge hurdles in competing due to limited resources, restraints, and smaller, down-sized staffs.

Retransmission consent is unevenly applied to broadcasters and not streamers, which disadvantages minority and independent networks.

Adopted in 1992, it warrants review by the FCC, which could report its findings to Congress.

Get creative in the pursuit of diversity. One gaming industry tech executive is taking a mentorship program on the road to campuses at Historically Black Colleges and Universities in order to provide minorities training in the industry.

Funding and access to capital remains critical. Private, government, and banking institutions have the power to increase access to funding for minorities and women in media and tech entrepreneurs.

And right now, I would love to turn it over to our Co-Lead Ellen.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

And next slide.

MEMBER SCHNED: Thank you, Skip. Thank you, Melody. You are amazing leaders on this committee.

Thank you to our Designated Federal Officers -- Jamila and Diana -- and the whole team at the FCC.

I have the opportunity to present the recommendations, based on the findings, based on the symposium that Skip and Melody referred to.

And, Chris, thank you for that eloquent description of our arguments kind of looking outside the box, because a lot of us are newbies to the CEDC.

Although I'm now to the CEDC this term, I'm not new to the FCC. It was my first job out of law school. I was (audio interference) college of the law, as a young FCC lawyer, and served under the tutelage of Roger Holberg in the Enforcement Division. So, I understood how policies got made at the FCC, and then, I went on to the Office of Legislative

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Affairs, and I understood our relationship with Congress.

So, our last two years, I really put my cap on to try -- and then, after leaving the FCC, I went to the private sector, first, at Viacom, and then, in the industry at Court TV, and others, during distribution.

That's all a backdrop to say that I put my thinking cap on to try and figure out ways, and advise our group as a team, how we can create or suggest some actionable steps for the Commission. Because, after all, this is the CEDC which is an FCC advisory committee.

And one of the conundrums we face is the multijurisdictional ping pong match that goes on with so many policies. Things are not directly under the FCC's purview because they were adopted by Congress. So, their hands are tied behind their backs to look at things or to change things that might need updating since the 1992 Act.

So, you're going to see that a lot of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

our proposals take the tact of suggesting to the FCC to create an NOI, Notice of Inquiry; to create a fact-based, industry-input database of information from all sectors of the industry, and then, taking that information and presenting it to Congress, as the expert agency who oversees enforcement and regulation of the industry.

So, that way, you have a dual approach for the FCC to be the fact-based finder and make recommendations, if it so believes they are warranted, to Congress, and then, work hand-in-glove with Congress to try and get changes adopted, whether it's to the Minority Tax Certificate or retransmission consent -- rather than all agencies throwing their hands up and saying "We either don't have primary jurisdiction or it's not a top priority right now." Because some of our issues kind of get put low on the totem pole. We say let's walk before we run and create NOIs and, hopefully, NPRMs, to help assist Congress and work hand-in-glove with Congress.

So, that's going to be the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

underpinning for our proposal. And with that, let me walk through them.

Proposal One -- and we heard this echoed earlier -- would be to have the FCC look favorably to encouraging Congress to reinstate the Minority Tax Certificate with safeguards and updates to take into consideration modern-day ownership parameters, modern-day minority ownership statistics, and modern-day ownership scenarios of some of the larger media companies.

We found, as Skip pointed out, that during our symposium, the minority ownership empirically works. We had data presented by NABOB, Jim Winston, and Adriana Waterson with Horowitz Media, and by Diane Sutter with the Broadcast Leadership Training Seminar, that showed statistically how many more minorities got the call to buy stations when stations were looking to be spun off by some other larger group because this 1031 tax incentive was a viable incentive to sell to minorities.

When it was eliminated, it was

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

eliminated kind of, you know, we believe, based on some of our speakers, hastily, without the FCC being able to step in and impose safeguards that they probably would have imposed to decide whether to yea or nay certain deals.

So, we believe that it's the right time to relook at the Minority Tax Certificate. The first step would be to conduct an NOI, so we can take a fact-based approach to getting information.

It's not just the FCC, Chairwoman Rosenworcel, Chris Wood, Ellen Schned saying, "We think the Minority Tax Certificate should be reinstated, FCC. Please submit that recommendation to Congress." It's you and the industry having a platform to be able to file comments, the research entities in our industry, which are phenomenal. We need your input to show us in black and white what the data is.

And we believe that data will point to the fact that, if the Minority Tax Certificate is reinstated, we will get a new influx of sales to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

minorities, and hopefully, a provision will be added this time around for women as well.

Our second recommendation would be for the FCC, Congress, the Administration, the Department of Justice, and the industry, collectively, to take a fresh look at retransmission consent. This policy was adopted when I was at the Commission after law school. And it was part of the 1992 Cable Act.

And many of you on this call and in the audience know what that is, but it was something that was adapted to try to encourage localism, local broadcast stations to be able to get access to local markets to provide important news and information.

It has worked. It works. And to the Senators and Congressman who adopted it commending the industry, who creatively figured out how to implement it, and kudos to the FCC for overseeing it.

However, that was 1992. The world has changed so dramatically since then. We have

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Charter's Spectrum News, who is providing local news to markets. And, you know, from a lot of the data that I read from statistics show that they're outpacing broadcasters in some markets on local news.

We have all sorts of other news information that people get via streaming. Yet, streaming companies are not subject to retransmission consent.

We have independent and minority networks who are pushed out. They are kind of pushed to the bottom of the totem pole because retransmission consent broadcasters get the first 20 slots when it comes to the talent placement, as well as they're able to be able to (audio interference) of those channels. And there's this ongoing debate of, are they really local when there's local market agreements and news is provided market to market?

Anyway, the list goes on. It's not our role to take a yea or nay position. We simply are encouraging strongly that the FCC

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

opens an NOI and collects the data. Information is power.

Let's take a look at how it's worked; how it's working; if it needs to be modified to keep in tune with streaming companies, with minority companies. Collect the data.

After that data is collected, then present this to Congress with recommendations, if it so chooses, to modify, to seek the repeal. Who knows what that answer is going to be?

But we just encourage that we don't wear blinders. We just believe information and data is key, and that's what this recommendation is referring to. Please open up an NOI on retransmission consent and let the industry on all sides, broadcast and cable, speak.

Our next slide, please.

Our third recommendation has been echoed here by other groups. And that's to create a resource side for the next generation of minority leaders, owners, and workers in the workplace. It's not all about ownership. You

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

can't go from A to Z overnight. And it's just as important to cultivate tomorrow's leaders today of minority hotshots in our industry, women as well.

And by doing so, you heard Melody talk about Ryan Johnson, who talked about his program Cxmmunity that does HBCU training for young students to get into the gaming industry.

LMU has programs which train students who want to get into broadcasting. There's so many incredible programs. But information is power. So, putting this information into a resource guide and making it available, and actually making it available in ways that today's consumers can understand it; making it available through social media; making it available through TikTok; making it available through music resources -- there's a variety of ways to disseminate information.

But getting a comprehensive look at how to upskill and provide opportunities, like the T. Howard Foundation does; and the cable

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

industry, like the Cable Center does with their entrepreneurship program; like Diane Sutter does with the Broadcast Leadership Training is so powerful. So, let's get that information out.

And just last week, I was able to go to an event called VME, Veterans in Media and Entertainment. Where are the roads and opportunities for us to all support our vets, who came back and have incredible skills from their time during the war, have ideas for screen plays?

How can we integrate them into our media ecosystem? Let's add them to our resource guide and provide them funding and access to jobs and internships in all of our companies.

Finally, our fourth area is what's been touched upon by every group, which is: show me the money, access to capital. Without capital, investor dollars, advertising dollars, phones, there is no programming; there is no acquiring sports rights; there is no cable operations. Access to capital is essential.

We applaud the Administration and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Congress for what they did with the BEAD draft with respect to providing money to build out the last mile for rural broadband. We applaud the SBA for the amazing programs they have.

We applaud the ad industry, who we heard from on our panel, for things they're doing to collectively use set-asides for minority, independent, and women networks and companies to be able to viably compete.

How do we get access to that capital and those resources? Information is power. That's why I love this CEDC that two years ago I didn't even know existed before Faith Bautista told me about it. It's a powerful public advisory committee. But while we're 75 members strong, the industry is millions and millions strong. So, we want more of you to get engaged in this dialog that we had the opportunity to have the last two years and provide input.

So, if the FCC creates structures, whether it's NOIs or advisory groups or think tanks, that create unified, crossover industry

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

input, which they already do, I think that next year, when we progress, after taking these recommendations, next year we want to see these implemented and pushed out to the community.

And let me touch on two last things on the access to capital -- three things.

No. 1, the AAPI community is a distant third in all metrics. They need extra attention, extra focus, and extra support. They're not looking for handouts. They just need access, like other Hispanic and African American and other genres. And there's more and more AAPI networks stepping up to the bat, up to the plate.

So, we'd love them to have extra focus.

No. 2, supplier diversity programs are great opportunities, but they're not playing out the way they should. Those need to be relooked at.

And three, tax incentives are powerful. And we talked about the 1031 exchange that the Minority Tax Certificate gives. Representative Yvette Clarke has a fantastic bill

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

pending that would provide tax incentives in other ways for cable operators to launch minority, women, and independent networks.

We would love a greater focus and collaboration between the FCC to look at that and by you and the industry to weigh in, both in this committee and with Congress, to see that implemented.

And on that note, I would like to relinquish my time, even though I've way overtalked my time, before we get back to Chris, I just want to point out that Patty Boyers, who is a partner in crime of mine in the industry -- and she came in from Poplar Bluff, Missouri to help the support the initiative and our small cable operator broadband perspective -- Patty, if you're anywhere near a microphone, can you just sort of introduce yourself real quick?

Because Patty is the hands-on operator. She is a cable operator in the trenches. So, while we might be in Washington as policymakers and government affairs executives,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

and think tanks and academics, hearing from the operators and general managers and the programming directors is absolutely essential.

So, Patty, if you can grab a mic, and then, throw it back to Chris, that would be great.

MS. BOYERS: Thank you, Ellen.

I grabbed the mic last week -- waiting on you to finish. Is she not a pip or what? Ellen is one of my dearest friends, and we've had our shoulders to the plow on a lot of different issues.

So, I thank Ellen for asking me to come to the symposium in February. I really enjoyed that because I got to see the other side of the coin really. I'm out there, literally, in the trenches -- I mean with a trencher -- plowing cable to this great digital divide that you all, everybody is talking about.

But I love the term that Mr. Brooks said, and Mr. Bauer said, about silos. The thing that I see so incredibly is the different silos.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

We've got feed money and all of this going out the door. We've got the great minds sitting around this table and the FCC. How do we -- I was telling Susan during the break -- how do we get there? How do we take all of this information, these wonderful ideas, these great, innovative, groundbreaking diversity and inclusion ideas, and put feet to them? That's the next step, I guess.

But, for an operator like me, I deal with these policies and these regulations on a daggum daily basis. And I want to jump in and echo that retransmission consent is long overdue.

I mean, 1992, Al gore hadn't even invented the internet.

So, when you start thinking about the differences in how everything is running today, as to how it ran in 1992 -- and I even know that the broadcasters themselves are preaching for "Help us out" because we've got this unregulated streaming now coming into play that is competing with them without the regulations. So, even NAB

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

is going, "We need to look at something here. We need to see."

So, retrans is not dissimilar to other policies that fall to the law of unintended consequences. That's something that the FCC can do. They can undo some of the crap that's already been done. That's going to allow us to move forward unencumbered to promote more of these ideas. That is something the FCC can do.

And I hope and pray that they get that message, along with what do we do with all this information that y'all have spent the last two years on.

I was humbled and honored to be included to help with this in whatever small way, but y'all have done a great thing here, and I'm impressed. And it takes a lot to impress an old gal from Missouri. I'm from the Show Me State.

So, thank you all, and I give it all back to Chris. I'm not giving it to Ellen.

(Applause.)

MEMBER C. WOOD: Thank you all so

much.

If the passion doesn't come through with what you just saw, I hope that you can see just how passionate this group is on every level.

And it's has sparked a lot of incredible conversation. So, thank you all for your work.

I think I want to underscore just with this note before I turn it back over to our fearless leaders. It's all interwoven. It really is all interwoven. Whether we're talking about broadcast media ownership, technology ownership, or the technologies tomorrow, visibility in these industries, along with equitable access to technologies of today and tomorrow, are incredibly important in creating possibility -- possibility of diversity, possibility of new ideas, possibility of including all of those operating and wanting access to the digital space.

So, I want to say thank you so much to my group. And to all of the CEDC, thank you so much for taking the time to listen. Thank you

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

for your support over the two years, which I know has been shifting back and forth from our initial real push around digital discrimination.

To my fellow Chairs, Dominique, I just really, really appreciate all that it is taking to get to this point.

With that, Heather Gate, I will go ahead and turn it back over to you, Honorable Chairwoman.

CHAIR GATE: Thank you. Thank you, Chris and crew.

Shall we ask questions? Oh, yes.

MEMBER C. WOOD: Yes, sorry, I forgot to ask if the group had any questions before I turned it back over. Apologies. I was getting into the passion there.

So, I would please open to the group for questions.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: So, Chris, thank you, and thank you for your kind words as well.

And to this entire group, as was

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

mentioned, the passion is there.

So, I have, actually, two questions. The first question, I want to go back to the Working Group on nontraditional anchor institutions and sort of get some comments from that group on one of the charges of this particular committee when it came to the infrastructure bill.

Currently, the statute defines traditional anchor institutions as schools and libraries. And I think this group found out that nontraditional anchor institutions from faith-based institutions, community organizations, and the like, are really not part of this discussion on building local infrastructure, and particularly, digital infrastructure in communities.

I'd like to at least hear from this group. Obviously, the FCC has engaged nontraditional anchor institutions in the outreach for the Affordable Connectivity Program, with regards to the Broadband Outreach Grants,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

but we haven't necessarily seen that on the same side for NTIA.

So, my first question -- and I'll stop here to get an answer, and then, I'll come back to my second question -- is: how do we, for that group, impress upon the powers that be to really see the significant value of investing in nontraditional anchor institutions?

And is there additional work, maybe going into the next committee, that we need to do, the next charter, that we need to do to really put that out there, that when the work was being done in communities during COVID, it was happening at nontraditional anchor institutions?

And it just seems like they're not fully recognized in this full ecosystem. Many of us around this table represent those groups.

I just wanted to hear a little bit more from the group on, what do you think are the best ways to sort of impress that message that nontraditional anchor institutions need similar support, as we try to close the digital divide?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

And it could be you or any member of the committee that has worked, specifically, on that particular Workstream.

MEMBER DILLARD: You know, I would like to give a very quick answer.

Odyssey -- and this was before I joined the company -- partnered with the New York Urban League. They represent women and a majority people of color, but, really, everybody, especially those coming from any underserved community.

And what the New York Urban League was able to do, to conduct diversity symposiums, utilizing our on-air assets for not only public service announcements, but long-form programming, online campaigns. We have done several cosponsored events, ranging from college fairs for intercity youth around New York City to job training, mentorship programs. And through our sponsorship as a media partner for the New York Urban League, we are also able to bring in tech executives to talk to kids, people from our

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

digital department. So, that is one example.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: Anyone else?

MEMBER NAHUJA: I would like to make a short comment. I know we have a time factor.

But one of the recommendations that we made was kind of continuing to have listening groups or people at FCC listen or hear these things.

I think that the passion that you heard, anyone that hears the passion and people talking about what they're actually doing, and the obstacles they're actually facing, I think will be moved.

So, the question really is, how can we get these people, you know, not just a write-up, but the visuals and them actually saying their piece in front of some of the power brokers -- or you're not power brokers -- but, you know, some of the people who are going to make the decisions?

I'm not sure how to schedule that, but I do think if you did have a listening group that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

went around and listened to people, or you had people actually involved in experiencing expert testimony about their organizations, I think that would make them in the room, even if they weren't at the table, in terms of how the policy is created.

Chris I'm going to let you -- you look like you're ready to say something. You have plenty to say. So, I'll let you go on.

MEMBER C. WOOD: No, it's important to hear from the group and those that really put in the work.

I think the FCC took an important step by involving groups that haven't traditionally been a part of this conversation within the CEDC.

And even though they may not understand the full procedures and policies, it's okay; they can learn that.

But hearing from these individuals around the country, you heard from Workstream 3 the diversity of groups that we interviewed. And we learned so much that we didn't know.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

And so, continuing to involve groups that may not have a national perspective, but maybe it's more regional; maybe it's more local -- they're the ones on the ground pulling these communities up by their bootstraps and really listening to the community in a way that I feel can inform the FCC in a way that they can make decisions within their purview. And if it's not within their purview, work with other agencies and Members of Congress, or state representatives, or state digital upskilling offices, or internet access offices, to make sure that we are providing services as a country to those who need it most, would be where I would go with it.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: And if I could just follow that second question, Madam Chairwoman?

Thank you for that.

And I would just also like to implore this committee to send the recommendations of this group directly to the NTIA to also break

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

down the silos on the FCC side, that it is all about consumption, the role that these groups are playing in advancing consumption of broadband, but I think these groups also play a very imperative role in being part of the productive capacity of how we bring more digital access to families and to eligible low-income families.

I had one other question, but if it's on this, Robert -- if it's okay, Madam Chairwoman, I can hold my question, because I do have a question on the broadcast.

MEMBER BRANSON: If I may, while I'm not a part of the committee, this group, I can't let it go by without saying that at Black Churches for Digital Equity, at MMTC, we are very much working with every state where we have a presence. And we're not just looking at getting out the message about ACP. We're also look at getting them involved. When the BEAD money is being distributed, we want our people in there. We want them on the committees.

And we work very closely with NTIA.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

In fact, we had a great meeting with Deputy Secretary Graves; also, Alan Davidson at NTIA.

So, you know, we want to be in the room where it happens, and we plan to have our people there. Because if you're not there, guess what? These dollars will be passed out and we will not get a part of it at all. And the best way to build out in a community is have people from the community building out in the community.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: Susan, did you want to say something?

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: With my knowledge of the ecosystem, of things happening in the country, I think that there's never been something like this body before in any community, any sector.

So, I'll take it from my closing comment. The FCC has demonstrated its commitment to diversity, helping the underserved community.

As we close today, or by the 29th, we will have a new chapter. I think it would be good for us not to leave it up to the next CEDC, whoever they

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

may be -- some may return; some may not; there will be some newcomers and new blood, new thinking -- for this group to think of what's the next step and help the next term pick up the ball. Leave something there.

And I think all we need to do is we have to have a campaign. We cannot just run on empty. I know you do a great job, a great job. You are present in those spaces. But this body is bigger than MMTC.

If you can organize, we can organize on our own, create a campaign and send the report to wherever we think we have a pair of willing ears and sharp eyes, that will start the work in the villages and towns. And we have it coming from the top of the FCC. We have folks coming from the bottom. And they will converge in the middle. So, at a time the next CEDC convenes, there will be already some movement. Okay?

And as to your question about how do we get the nontraditional anchor institutions, I think it's for us now to begin to define, find a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

definition. In this industry, what are considered anchor institutions? Like what you said, what you do in the private sector, you do something which is really good, meaningful, that has impact. That's important because that's the way the American people, the people on the ground think, "I can do that." And there are plenty of them, particularly the young ones who are very social-oriented, very much into helping the next-door neighbor.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: No, I agree, and thank you, everyone, for entertaining that question. Because I think it's really important to where it's out of the jurisdiction of the FCC, potentially. It's more Congress' jurisdiction to really reframe what is an anchor institution.

And it's important to continue to have that conversation if there are implications for funding and other things, as my colleague Susan has said, when it comes to organizations who are doing the great work every day in these spaces.

I have another question, though, on

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

the broadcast side. And so, it's interesting that, for the last decade that I've been on this Commission, that we continue to talk about the re-up of the Minority Tax Certificate. And I think it was clear today from Commissioner Simington that there is some appetite to sort of think of the media ownership rules, and particularly, the uncompleted 2018 quadrennial ruling on ownership rules.

So, I do think that I want to commend that group on sort of thinking through some 21st century ways to actually bring up the conversation of the recertification of the Minority Tax Certificate, but to do it in a way that there's new data brought to the table.

Because I think that consideration, in and of itself, should be commended and commendable, because we're still sort of still using the same pegs to sort of define what minority ownership looks like. And the last report was disturbing because we have not made any progress since the Tax Certificate was

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

pulled.

The other thing I just wanted to ask this group as well, you know, much of the work of this charter in the last two years has been centered around the infrastructure investment dollars.

And so, the other question is -- and it was in here, and I know Ellen was on a roll; she was a Baptist preacher for a minute -- but I think there was something in your report that wasn't mentioned, which is around ad spend. So, would love to hear from this group how you thought about ad spend, particularly at a time where there will be federal procurements.

I think Leticia mentioned it. Not many people online. So, they're going to get their messages from Skip and all these stations before they get it from a digital source. So, just curious about that particular recommendation. Are there opportunities with the infrastructure bill for broadcasters to also be part of those conversations from a supply

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

diversity perspective?

MEMBER DILLARD: I wanted to hear from Melody.

So, I'll just briefly say that the millions of dollars spent on health from the government during COVID-19 was a lifeline for many stations. There were monies that were targeted to communities of color -- Latino, African American, LGBTQ. And I know of one cluster in New York that was about \$7 million in the year, and that saved business and jobs.

I think that we see that, you know, in better times we do need to find out a pathway to get more government spending to broadcast media.

Many times it goes digital; other times it goes to various resources, billboards.

But, you know, I think that having especially small, local broadcasts, TV and radio, to get more of the ad spend that Uncle Sam does every year is crucial. And we need to find a pathway to do it. We need to educate new, young owners and existing owners on how to better work

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

with government.

You know, we produce results, and we need to understand how to better work together with our own government to procure more dollars.

That can also assist with ownership.

Now, did you have anything to add here?

MEMBER SPANN COOPER: Thanks, Skip, and thanks, Dr. Lee, for bringing that up.

You are 110 percent correct. We did benefit greatly from the COVID dollars that were spent from the Department of Health.

But you think about when there's not a time of catastrophe. You think about the spending with defense and the Army. And this happens both at the federal level, but statewide.

You have tax dollars that are often given to advertising agencies who begin to spend the money as if and at the same jurisdiction as they do private funds, right?

So, they can't find a WVON in Chicago if there's not a pandemic. They cannot find --

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

and this is across the board. And I think, not only -- when you think about the Army, for instance, they spend \$39 million advertising. They give all of the dollars to a general market agency who does no spending with minority broadcasters, right?

And so, third-tier opportunities and our government, our legislators, not only in direct business from the federal, but businesses that are regulated by the government should be mandated to spend dollars.

Our company is doing better -- and this is sad to say -- post-George-Floyd. When companies come and make equitable spends with our company -- and you think about so many of these companies are spending millions of dollars and not one dollar with some of our companies. Yet, we are reaching community in a very authentic way, which can carry it. Not charity work, but B2B with us, right?

And so, I'm hoping -- I'm so glad this came up in our Workstream -- and I'm hoping in

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

the next cohort that we really drive this beyond acquisition. Because let me something. I have access to capital when I'm able to do business equitably. I've got my own capital to go, you know, and purchase. And that's the way people have to look at us. We shouldn't be starved and doing business, and that's often how we feel, and I felt.

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: Yes, thank you.

And the law is there for you. President Biden signed into law Executive Order 13985 a year ago, instructing all federal agencies with purchasing power to increase the annual spend on minority businesses from 5 to 15 percent in the next two years. All federal agencies, the Office of Small and Disadvantaged Business Utilization, have been on the highway looking for people like us to say, "I want to help you."

We need to climb onto that platform. I mentioned this at our February Symposium on Women and Minority Ownership. I said there's

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

money starting from the CARES Act. MBDA was given \$1 billion to spend on minority organizations. To do what? To do what? Not provide services, doing anything technical. Outreach. That is what I said in February; in 2020, May, MBDA had \$1 billion for these Asian, Black, Hispanic, Native Americans to reach out and say, "Look, this is what you need to go out and tell your people about the PPP, about the" -- I don't know.

Right now, yesterday, a Commissioner mentioned there is about \$700 -- is it "B" or million dollars? -- left over for traditional, for media outreach, media work. We need to go in that -- I have a feeling that we are so overwhelmed with our lives, with our work, and this idea is so complicated. It's slowly coming in. There's so many different agencies. We want to, we want to, but we have no bandwidth to do so.

That's why having this group, before we disband, come together and say, "Look, we need

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

to have a campaign," and go out and educate everybody and get them in.

I remember saying that way, way back and saying, "No, we've got to go, go there and get on the train before they leave you behind on the platform." We will be left behind on the platform when the train goes.

MEMBER SPANN COOPER: Yes. So, one last thing on this. Sue Allen, you were 110 percent correct. And I think the government has done their part, but I think who they contract with, they sign the legislation, and then, they just make the assumption that they will do the right thing. There has to be some kind of regulation or someone who checks to make sure that these dollars are doing what they are set out to do.

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: And that's what Workstream 1 did on supply diversity.

MEMBER SPANN COOPER: Yes.

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: And that's what we're trying to put into that recommendation;

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

that we monitor, we audit, a friendly audit. We ask them to do a lot more.

So, that's why I hear echoing in this room today, as, okay, we spent all the time, all the money, our own money, our goodwill, and come up with the research, the analysis, and interviewed 150 people, or whatever. What do we do with it? Is it going to stay on that shelf and collect dust? Or are we going to take it and make it into an old book that you've read 1500 times, because people use it so often? We've got to do this now. Otherwise, we'll regret it.

MEMBER SPANN COOPER: Uh-hum.

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: Help me now.

MEMBER C. WOOD: Madam Chair, I know we are 30 minutes over and I just want to, like, see where we're at to make sure that we're staying on schedule.

MEMBER HOUGHTON: Yes, we just have one question here.

CHAIR GATE: Yes, let me give the floor -- Joycelyn has been trying to talk for a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

while now. Let's recognize her, and then, we will move on.

MEMBER HOUGHTON: Thank you.

And I just wanted to go back to address Dr. Lee's point about nontraditional anchor institutions, just to say that, at the National Coalition on Black Civic Participation, we just started this month partnering with an anchor institution, Clark Atlanta University. And we have a Dortch Institute there where we have started a Digital Equity and Connectivity Project, where we will be working with our State affiliates through that Institute to get out into the community, get them to connect with State broadband offices.

And particularly in the South, in order for communities to be able to learn how to negotiate -- well, not negotiate -- but make sure that they educate the State broadband offices on the needs; where we need this broadband equity funding from the NTIA and the Affordable Connectivity Program, doing outreach for those

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

programs.

So, that is one way that the nontraditional anchor institutions can partner with their traditional anchor institutions in order to make sure that this funding is distributed equitably.

CHAIR GATE: Thank you so much.

I believe somebody had their hand up, but they've put it down. And we'll return in the next charter.

MEMBER SCHNED: Let me just paraphrase something that -- this is Ellen Schned -- on that point, which, Nicol, is such a great point, because we could have a whole symposium, and I hope we will, on advertising, because it's just so critical.

And I know the advertising industry, it does want to do well and do good and work with us. But one of the things Jim Winston underscored was the fact, one of the issues that Melody raised, which is a lot of these ad buys by the government dollars actually go national,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

because it's a more efficient and a more reasonably buy just to buy national. And when you do that with these huge media companies, it cuts out the smaller, minority companies.

And so, that's part of something to look at for the buys for military advertising, as well as other advertising, but as well as supplier diversity. That same paradigm applies where a lot of now big mega-companies are getting the supplier diversity money, instead of independents.

So, yes, I hope we look at that. But that is something that was raised in our group.

MEMBER C. WOOD: Thank you. Thank you, Ellen. Thank you, everyone. Thank you, Dominique, for giving us a little more time.

With that, Madam Chair, I turn it back over to you.

CHAIR GATE: Thank you. And, oh, we lost a break as well.

Thank you. So, thank you, Diversity and Equity Working Group, for fantastic work.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

The passion, again, it speaks for itself.

And thank you, Patty, for providing public comments. We really appreciate your participation in this.

And I just wanted to remind everybody that this morning, with the Innovation and Access Working Group, one of their recommendations did speak to loan guarantees and federal advertising contracts. So, we voted and we had comment from the public.

All right. So now, we have one matter to deal with before we get to our vote pertaining to Workstream 4's report.

Susan would like to talk about some edits --

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: Yes.

CHAIR GATE: -- basic editorial privileges, nothing that will be a big change.

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: Nothing earth-shattering, but informative for folks who will read this.

CHAIR GATE: Oh, I'm sorry, before you

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

move on, just a reminder, you have everything in your folders.

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: Yes.

CHAIR GATE: So, if you need to refer to the document that she's talking to, please feel free to do so. She will be pointing out where she would like to propose some edits.

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: I did these editorial comments, and hopefully, it will be accepted as the legislative history of the work to this point. And so, some added information will be good for posterity.

On the recommendations to increase minority and female media ownership, Workstream 4, under the Executive Summary, page 4 --

CHAIR GATE: Read the document --

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: The document is called "Recommendation to Increase Minority and Female Media Ownership." -- the first line of the document. Got it? It says, "As Submitted by Workstream 4."

You flip over the recommendation, and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

then, you go to page 2. It says, "Executive Summary." See that? Page 2 on the top. That's the section.

And then, flip over to page 4, with the paragraph starting with "After years of efforts to encourage....," I counted the lines to make it easy for you. Line 12, starting, "National Diversity Coalition." Are you with me?

CHAIR GATE: Uh-hum.

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: "Coalition, NDC, and ChimeTV." Next line, "Diana WP Ding," -- I'd like to add "20-year veteran".

It's important for me to point out because Asian Americans, as Ellen has pointed out, have 1 percent of the business. And I want to demonstrate that there's a woman, a little woman who looked like me, just my size, started her career as a television owner, producer, and journalist 20 years ago. She flew in from California to speak to this symposium.

I'd like to add, after her name, "Diane WP Ding" -- and she puts "WP" there

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

because her last name is Ding. And to call her TV station "Ding Ding TV," it doesn't sound good.

But she says, "You're with that big stigma."

"Diane WP Ding" -- I'd like to add "20-year veteran," and then, continue with the "TV station owner in Silicon Valley," if it's okay.

All right. Then, on the 13th line, starting with "Commerce Education Foundation" -- are you there? -- "U.S. (audio interference) Susan Au Allen" -- I meant, sorry, the line before that. I just want to correct my name also. Okay.

The line before that, "Valley, Ding Ding TV and CEDC Vice Chair and CEO of the US Pan Asian American." Being American is very important to my organization, my people, because they do not want to be treated as foreigners, as a Chinese spy. Okay? Please put "American" back. No hyphenated. We're only singly worded, Pan.

PARTICIPANT: I put "American Asian"

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

there?

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: No, "Asian American." "Asian American," is we can do that.

And then, skip over to the 17th line of the same paragraph, the line starting with "AANHPI," this is the first time this Executive Summary has mentioned this acronym. So, I'd like to define it for you and put in parentheses "Asian American, Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islanders". So, people know what "AANHPI" is. That's what I want to do.

Then, the next paragraph, starting with, "The symposium showcased," the last word of that paragraph, "industries," I'd like to add this (audio interference) "interview broadcast reports, such as the one, the mass shooting in the Monterey Park Studio in California in January."

This is very important because very few people reported on that, even Asian Americans. She went all the way from where she was in Central City down to Monterey Park and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

actually conducted the interview right after the shooting. So, I'd like to have that in there, if I could.

Then, flip over to page 9, the paragraph starting with, at the bottom, "CEDC Vice Chair Susan Au Allen" -- find that? The third line, I'd like to add "available for," delete "reaching," quote, "broadband user skills," and insert -- I'll read the whole sentence for you.

I'd rather read this from the beginning of the paragraph. It will take less than one minute. "CEDC Vice Chair Susan Au Allen emphasized exploring areas in the Coronavirus Aid, Relief, and Economic Security Act, CARES, for funding, including Digital Equity Act; i.e., funds available for" -- insert: "outreach to the underserved," and then, "served communities to inform them of funding opportunities to educate, train, and employ skilled workers to meet the need of the digital economy. These are revenue streams for broadcasters -- TV, cable, radio,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

digital, et cetera -- a source of capital not to be ignored."

That's the edits that I would like to add.

And I think Group Chris Wood has been informed about this and he had no issue with that. We just couldn't get it into the report here in time.

CHAIR GATE: And for the record, Chris, can you let us know if you accept those edits?

MEMBER C. WOOD: Yes, I formally accept the edits and thank you for those edits, Susan.

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: Okay. Great.

CHAIR GATE: Thank you, Susan. Thank you. And now we can vote -- and apologize to Dominique.

Okay. So, Chris, would you like to submit your report?

MEMBER C. WOOD: Yes, I would like to formally submit the report to the full CEDC for

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

approval and acceptance to send on to the FCC in conclusion of our full CEDC Working Group.

CHAIR GATE: Thank you. And do I have a second to that motion? Thank you.

So, you have the recommendations in front of you. So, I won't read them. They were articulately read by the Working Group members. But, however, I would like to seek unanimous consent.

So, these are recommendations to address -- we're dealing with Workstream 2's and Workstream 3's reports, first of all.

The recommendations are to address the digital future of work and encourage participation of nontraditional anchor institutions in the digital ecosystem, submitted by Workstream 2, "Future of Work," and Workstream 3, "Nontraditional Anchor Institutions," of the Diversity and Equity Working Group.

Now, I would like to seek unanimous consent. And if anybody has any objections or wishes to abstain, please speak.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Anybody online?

Thank you. The vote passes. Thank you so much, and congratulations to Chris and the Working Group.

(Applause.)

CHAIR GATE: Okay. And then, on Workstream 4, having accepted the editorial privileges submitted by our Vice Chair.

Recommendations to increase minority and female media ownership, submitted by Workstream 4, "Diverse Media Communications and Tech Ownerships," of the Diversity and Equity Working Group.

They are submitting their report in four recommendations, as read by the Working Group.

I would like to seek unanimous consent. And if anyone has any objections or wishes to abstain, please speak up.

Okay. And that report and the recommendations are adopted as well. So, thank you.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

(Applause.)

CHAIR GAGE; Okay. And now I would like to introduce our highly-patient --

PARTICIPANT: Madam Chairwoman, I just have a question. Do you want to give us a new timeline --

CHAIR GATE: Yes.

PARTICIPANT: -- in that we're about 30 minutes behind?

CHAIR GATE: We are 30 minutes behind. However, we have until four o'clock, and I believe this Working Group has one report to present. So, we should be able to do that and offer our closing statements within that time. Please be succinct in your comments. Be succinct and do not repeat. Just nod.

But, anyway, thank you. Thank you.

Dominique, you can have the floor.

MEMBER HARRISON: Yes. You know, I think it was the amazing and great Congresswoman Maxine Waters who said, "Reclaiming my time."

(Laughter.)

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

MEMBER HARRISON: But I will be succinct today.

So, good afternoon, everyone. I want to, first, thank Chairwoman Rosenworcel and all the FCC Commissioners for their leadership.

As Chair of the Digital Empowerment and Inclusion Working Group, it has been a pleasure to serve over the course of two years in the effort to advance equity in the provision of, and access to, digital communications services and products for all people of the United States.

I want to thank our CEDC Chair and Vice Chairs for their guidance and support in empowering our Working Group to fulfill our objectives.

And I also want to thank each of our FCC's Designated Federal Officers for their encouragement and stewardship along the way.

Today, I am pleased to share a review of our work over the past two years. I am so appreciative, thankful, and proud of all the hard work our group undertook to complete our tasks,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

and I want to thank each member for their participation and support.

Next slide. Thank you to Dr. Christopher Ali, Yvette Badu-Nimako, Clayton Banks, Robert Branson, Michelle Corbett, Sarah Kate Ellis, Matt Wood, Dr. Jon Gant, Anisa Green, Rebecca Gibbons, Hooman Hedayati, Chris James, Nicolaine Lazarre, Louis Peraertz, Vickie Robinson, and Antonio Williams.

Next slide. Next slide. Okay, I'll keep reading.

Our Working Group has four objectives.

The first is to identify innovative solutions and provide recommendations for how to accelerate the equitable deployment of broadband access in all communities, including those communities that comprise people of color and others who have been historically underserved, marginalized, and adversely affected by persistent poverty and inequitable in access to technology, communications services, and next generation networks, which have resulted in

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

negative impacts in education and employment.

Our second objective is to provide recommendations for reducing and removing regulatory barriers to the equitable deployment of and investment in broadband access and adoption in all communities, including tribal, rural, and historically-marginalized communities.

Three, provide recommendations for strengthening existing networks and developing new ones.

And four, provide recommendations for addressing digital redlining and other barriers that impact equitable access to emerging technology in underserved and under-connected communities, including among people of color, persons with disabilities, and LGBTQ-Plus communities.

Today, you will hear more from me and our team Co-Leads on how we achieved our goals.

Next slide. The passage of the Infrastructure Investment and Jobs Act made the largest federal investment into universal

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

broadband access in our history by providing critical resources to increase access to technology. The IIJA also presented unprecedented opportunity to address the issue of digital discrimination -- an issue that many communities have long spoken about.

With our Working Group's objectives in mind, and the directives set within the Infrastructure Act, our group was given the immediate task to tackle the issue of digital discrimination. We received an urgent request by Chairwoman Rosenworcel for our Working Group to recommend model policies and best practices that can be adopted by states and localities to ensure that broadband internet access service providers do not engage in digital discrimination.

And on November 7th of 2022, our Working Group responded to this task by submitting our report, "Recommendations and Best Practices to Prevent Digital Discrimination and Promote Digital Equity." And you'll hear more about this report in a moment.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Next slide. Given our initial request by the Chairwoman, we developed three Workstreams to advance our objectives.

Workstream 1 focused on model policies and best practices to prevent digital discrimination.

Workstream 2 undertook listening sessions on lessons learned in connecting Opportunity Communities to broadband during the COVID-19 pandemic.

And Workstream 3 produced a public convening on connecting Opportunity Communities to broadband during the COVID-19 pandemic.

Next slide. All members of the DEI Working Group played an essential part in getting us to the finish line for each Workstream. There were also specific individuals in our Working Group who provided their extra time, effort, and expertise.

Once we finished our work on the digital discrimination report through Workstream 1, members splintered off into Workstream 2 and 3

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

to finish the remainder of our tasks. Thank you to each of our Co-Leads and lead writers for their commitment and unwavering support.

Next, you'll hear from Workstream 1 Co-Lead Dr. John Gant for an overview of our digital discrimination report.

I also want to give a shout out to former Member Joi Chaney, formerly of the National Urban League, for helping in stewarding that work.

Then, you will hear from Co-Leads Dr. Christopher Ali and Chris James from Workstream 2, along with Working Group Members Anisa Green and Matt Wood.

Lastly, you will hear from Clayton Banks, Workstream 3 Co-Lead, for a report out on our public event that happened in March.

I, again, want to shout out to the Co-Leads Sarah-Kate Ellis and Vickie Robinson, who couldn't be here, but are part of Workstream 3.

So, without further ado -- next slide

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

-- I'll turn it over to Dr. Jon Gant.

MEMBER GANT: Well, good afternoon.

I heard there was a graduation this morning. So, I thought I would put on my regalia for my presentation. No, just joking.

You know, as a Dean and Professor, I am always so happy when we do think about graduation, and this is a very important day, given that this Council has been working for the last two years on such very important issues.

So, I'll just take a few minutes. I'll keep it brief, especially to give the other two groups more airtime to share their very important work that they've completed.

But I also just want to extend my thanks to everyone for all the hard work that we did.

This issue that we had to deal with, digital discrimination, was a very significant challenge because we had to bring so many different stakeholders together. And as we were working on this, there was a working quote that I

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

actually put in the document, just to kind of help us stay on task. And it was just a very important quote from Dr. Martin Luther King talking about the "fierce urgency of now."

There's absolutely no question that, while we were working on this digital discrimination responsibilities for our Workstream, this was in the middle of COVID, the pandemic. The Infrastructure Act was being passed, and as well as the directive from the FCC on implementing the program to look at digital discrimination. So, this really helped to drive us.

And then, as we've been speaking, we see how quickly technology has changed and relies on this broadband infrastructure to really reach everyone and to really drive progress for all people in a way that focuses on equity and access.

So, our goals -- and I'll keep this brief -- were pretty straightforward. Recall our goal for the Workstream was, in particular, to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

help the CEDC provide recommendations to the FCC on model policies and best practices.

Our Workstream also considered some other important goals and assumptions.

First, we focused on looking at how access could be equitable and affordable for broadband, and how critical that is for driving our U.S. economy.

Secondly, we acknowledged and discussed at great detail about the significant investments that have been made to expand access to broadband and the digital divide.

And we also considered that policymakers and government officials and providers are under great pressure to really make sure that deployment was being done in dealing with issues where access is a challenge.

And then, lastly, we talked very significantly about the relationship of the digital divide as an important part of the digital discrimination to really help sort out all the different particular issues.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

So, next slide.

So, we conducted a large number of interviews with stakeholders. We tried to take a 360-degree perspective around the issue. And our committee was fabulous in reaching out to stakeholders to invite them into our interviews.

We developed a regular cadence for these interviews. Our team members were there. We had a pattern of asking the questions, and so forth.

And it really gave us a lot of deep insight, and frankly, very frank, candid discussions about these very particular issues. At times, you know, it got very -- we've been using the word "robust" -- but it did help us to understand all the different contexts around digital discrimination.

So, key lessons that we learned are: digital divide is urgent and imperative. Digital discrimination is a complex issue, and it appears in multiple contexts.

There was a basic working definition of discrimination, but, frankly, there were a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

number of different definitions. So, we wrestled with what is a really good definition of this as well, too.

You know, we have a number of team members who have legal backgrounds. And so, this very important question about intent really came up quite a bit. And we made recommendations that that's actually an issue that should be further examined.

And we also considered technologies being used and there's different outcomes in vulnerable populations. So, how do you sort that out from discrimination as well, too?

We really learned that state and localities should work with ISPs in this process.

And then, we also considered franchise agreements as well.

So, next slide, please.

So, there were some key recommendations. We actually have presented this already. So, I'll just summarize them quickly.

But the first is really to help create

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

efforts to make the public more aware of broadband equity assessments, and that may involve ISPs, committees, and other stakeholders working together to do that.

Greater awareness about information-sharing among multiple dwelling unit owners, so there's more competition for MDUs, and so forth.

Identify local opportunities to incentivize equitable deployment.

Next slide.

Also, where permissible under law, look at opportunities for modifying how the use of public right-of-ways can be managed to avert potentially discriminatory behaviors and redlining, and so forth.

Convening redlining with broadband providers, stakeholders, community anchors, and others to evaluate the extent to which households are in areas of unserved or underserved, and how to enhance competition and the quality of the broadband options.

Encourage fair competition and choice.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Next slide.

And some of the other key recommendations that we made are around digital equity, because we know there's kind of a hand-in-glove relationship.

So, in terms of recommendations of digital equity -- and we did want to separate this out, so that was an important part that we added that went beyond our initial mission.

But, in particular, make low-cost broadband available to low-income households through various programs.

Build on the success of the programs that were rolling out and look at how we can extend those further.

We know there's just a big need for greater awareness about these opportunities for connectivity programs to eligible households.

Next slide.

Strengthen marketing communication. Streamline that application process that's involved with this.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Increase the support for community anchor institutions, schools, nonprofits, faith-based organizations to provide digital navigation services in the communities in which they serve.

Fund and promote the use of Digital Navigators as well.

Next slide.

Stakeholders should encourage Congress about the great digital public service and engagement programs, such as the Digital Navigators. And we do see that in the Infrastructure Act to some extent.

Increase device access and participation.

Leverage public-private partnerships to facilitate remote learning and to help close that homework gap.

Next slide.

Ensure members of the community have safe spaces for using the internet.

The digital skilling has been talked about by our other group, and we've talked about

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

that quite a bit as well, too, and how to really strength that digital skilling, especially in underserved communities.

And also, hand-in-hand with that, workforce development, training opportunities, and particularly, focusing on historically-unrepresented communities.

Next slide.

And so, that's the report in a nutshell. And we've had a chance to present this in a longer form previously, but we did want to be able to share this work with you.

And with that, I will relinquish my time and pass it on to Workstream 2, where Chris James will lead us through the work that they did in Workstream 2.

Thank you.

MEMBER JAMES: Thank you very much.

And I was part of Workstream 2, Co-Lead with Christopher Ali. So, I'll turn it over to Dr. Ali just a moment.

Just a little bit of high-level

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

overview. Of course, we had listening sessions and the lessons we learned, and that's what we're going to talk about today.

We had multiple interviews from many stakeholders, including federal agencies. And really, these interviews were really eye-opening, I think, to everybody on the committee, really getting down to the issues during the COVID-19 pandemic.

So, I just had the introductory slide.

I want to turn it over to Dr. Ali, who can talk more about what we did.

Next slide, please.

MEMBER ALI: Hi, everyone. Hi, everyone.

Sorry I wasn't able to be there in person, but greetings from a beautiful day here in State College, Pennsylvania.

Just to get started with some thanks you's, I want to thank Dr. Dominique Harrison for her leadership of our committee and (audio interference) leadership in the FCC.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Second, to my fabulous Co-Workstream Co-Lead Chris James, thank you for your energy and your friendship.

To the entirety of Workstream 2, you were all amazing. Your commitment, your enthusiasm, and your insights made these two years an absolute gift.

Huge thanks as well to Anisa Green and Matt Wood. You're going to hear from them in just a few slides. They were the artists, the architects, and the anchors of the written report for Workstream 2. Thank you for your dedication, your brilliance, your patience, and your leadership. And the two of you are the true heroes of our workstream.

And last, but not least, thank you to all of our interviewee respondents who took time to share their wisdom, your insights, and their experiences with that.

And with that in mind, let me tell you a little bit about the background going into our report. It began with the observation that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

several federal agencies, state agencies, counties, municipalities, private organizations, and community and nonprofit organizations developed emergency broadband programs and programming as a direct result of the COVID-19 pandemic.

It, then, however, led to a lament that we actually lacked substantive and systematic data about the types, experiences, successes, and challenges of these programs.

Next slide, please.

So, with this in mind, our Workstream was charged with soliciting information from key stakeholders across ISPs, federal agencies, working with emergency broadband funding, state agencies, and community organizations. And we did that by grouping these into buckets in terms of federal agencies, state agencies, counties and municipalities, private companies, community institutions and organizations, and nonprofit organizations. And that's how we began, kind of brainstorming who our stakeholders were going to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

be.

Next slide, please.

And again, just to kind of reiterate what Chris James had just said, our Workstream was charged with soliciting information from key stakeholders across these many groups. And we aimed to identify and understand lessons learned from programs that provided broadband connectivity to Opportunity Communities during the pandemic around five key questions.

First, what programs were created during the pandemic to fund broadband deployment and affordability?

Second, how did these programs work?

Third, what emergency broadband funding program responses worked well?

Fourth, what responses could be changed and/or adopted more broadly moving forward?

And fifth, to what extent were these efforts in connectivity opportunities to broadband?

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

And now, I'm going to turn it over to Anisa Green, who will tell us about how our Workstream went about addressing these questions.

MEMBER GREEN: I'm just going to say thank you broadly and not name anybody. Thank you, thank you, thank you.

So, the Workstream 2, as Dr. Ali just said, we conducted interviews. We had about 15 interviews, in addition to some desk research and good old internet research.

And so, we hit on all of these pockets. You see the tiles on your screen.

From the local official area, we met with a representative from the New Mexico Public School Facilities Authority, and we also met with the City of Albuquerque.

From the consumer and public interest group representatives group, we met with the National Consumer Law Center and the Metropolitan AME Church, a representative from there.

From the federal side, we met with the Department of Education.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

From an industry association perspective, we met with all of the acronyms: CTIA, NCTA, NTIA, NTCA, and USTelecom -- all of them.

From a tribal perspective, we met with the American Indian Policy Institute and the -- is it Cheyenne Sioux? Is it Cheyenne or Cheyenne River Sioux? Cheyenne? Cheyenne. Good, my mother will be very proud. Cheyenne River Sioux Tribe Telephone Authority.

From a provider perspective, we met with the WISPA ISP and the Peoples Rural Telephone Cooperative.

And last, but not least, from a county perspective, we met with representatives from the National Association of Counties.

Next slide.

Matt, are you ready?

MEMBER M. WOOD: I think so.

Hi, everyone. I'll follow Anisa's good lead and not thank everyone individuals, and just say, "Hello."

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

This morning, Otto mentioned he was attending virtually, thanks to a fifth grade graduation in the DC Public Schools. So, we have a fifth grade promotion next week. And so, I'm attending virtually because I have a bit of a fifth grader's cold -- hopefully, the last one of the school year. So, I regret not being there in person, but I thought it best not to share it with anyone there.

Of course, I can attend online, thanks to the FCC's allowance for hybrid gatherings and the fact that, unlike so many people, I have access to high-speed broadband that I can't afford. Making and maintaining broadband connections for millions more people is what our interviewees spoke to, the ones that Anisa just listed for you.

So, I'll touch briefly on nine lessons learned from those interviews that we conducted. The first five are positive lessons that interviewees recommended the Commission build upon, and the final four include suggestions for

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

improvements, based on things that work less well.

First, interviewees suggested and uniformly praised public-private partnerships between ISPs and local governments, libraries, housing authorities, healthcare providers, school districts, and universities.

They cited partnerships between ISPs and a wide range of community pillars, such as churches and other faith-based organizations, nonprofit foundations that funded subscriber connections long before federal and state broadband adoption support dollars started to flow, and grassroots organizations that were trusted sources of information on those aid programs.

As we've heard from other Workstreams, too, our interviewees uniformly noted that internet service providers must build connections and trust over time with partnering organizations and the populations they serve. Companies cannot expect to reach out only in times of crisis and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

have the same good results.

Listening to local leaders and impacted individuals is always key in all uniquely challenging environments for broadband deployment and affordability, such as tribal lands, of course, and other rural areas with difficult topography and distance between people's homes, but also in impoverished and underserved areas in cities, such as economically-disadvantaged neighborhoods, communities of color, and populations in which English is not the predominant language.

Second, interviewees discussed the need for broadband adoption programs, subsidies, training, and outreach to, quote, "meet people where they are," closed quote. And I know that's another phrase I know we've heard today and throughout the CEDC's work.

That is, of course, a literal mandate to get into the communities where people lack access to broadband or the ability to pay for it.

In urban areas, people can attend trainings at

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

inconvenient hours or locations, and in rural or in tribal areas, travel is also expensive or even prohibitive.

But it also means much more than that, too -- encompassing the need to reach people in the languages they speak, on the communications channels they actually use, and in relevant terms that explain the value of connectivity without stigmatizing those who apply for support.

During our interviews, people emphasized the importance of local coordination and engagement with trusted stakeholders. And that coordination happened, thanks in large part to the FCC's understanding of the need for such trusted navigators and community liaisons, coupled with the fact that the infrastructure bill included funding for ACP outreach grants.

Third, interviewees suggested that all the measurements they were able to gather show that new federal funding programs had a positive impact. New programs, like EBB, ACP, and a school-focused Emergency Connectivity Fund, or

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

ECF, all worked to increase adoption levels nationwide -- in particular, for the student populations and other Opportunity Communities, so often spoken of here. And yet, these institutions were often so busy just doing what they needed to do to get people connected, that measurement and assessment sometimes came second.

I'll have more on that in just a second.

Fourth -- and that's the next slide, please -- the EBB and ACP increased affordability at a time of great job loss and economic upheaval. When people were choosing between putting food on the table or paying rent, on the one hand, and having the broadband necessary for remote work and school and health care on the other, any income support they received was helpful, regardless of whether they could have stayed online somehow without it.

Our participants recognized the positive impact that expanding EBB and ACP eligibility beyond Lifeline's previously-established criteria during the COVID crisis and

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

the recovery that followed. And they also praised the ECF, which set aside more than \$7 billion for schools and libraries to provide connectivity as well.

Fifth, community organizations and local agencies played a vital role to fund connectivity, and then, advertised the availability of newly-created federal subsidy programs. Interviewees explained that, even before all the new federal programs were up and running, nonprofits, schools, state education departments, and universities were working to ensure that their students could learn virtually during times of mandatory shutdowns.

But community anchors, like churches, libraries, and American Legion posts also took part in awareness programs, outreach campaigns, and enrollment drives to inform people of their eligibility for federal and industry programs, then helped them navigate those sign-up processes.

So, that's it for the positive lessons

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

learned, the ones that were not at all negative, but maybe something for the Commission to look forward to and to do in different ways next time around are on the next slide. And despite these successes, we heard these areas for improvement from our interviewees, too.

First, there were not enough resources to get to 100 percent connectivity, either in specific Opportunity Communities or nationwide. While the \$14.2 billion investment in ACP was a landmark figure, it's not nearly enough to keep millions of households connected for the long term.

The ACP will run out of funding during 2024, absent congressional renewal. ISP representatives said they would like to continue their lower-priced offerings and keep subsidized subscribers online, but they expressed doubt about their ability to do that without a consistent funding stream.

Second, there were challenges increasing awareness about newly-created federal

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

programs, especially during times of health crises and economic upheaval. And here, I do want to provide just a few more examples and not just stay with the top-line bullet.

We heard from interviewees that there were a lot outreach techniques they used, but some had results that were rather hard to measure or worse than hoped. For instance, sign-up events can be incredibly effective if done right, but not if community members are not given enough notice.

Trusted community partners and businesses are better messengers, but sometimes non-local companies would send agents to communities where they had no track record or presence.

Text messaging and other outreach methods that require potential recipients to already have some level of connectivity may be wholly ineffective.

Mass media advertising may reach broad audiences locally and nationally, but it's

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

difficult to measure conversion rates and return on investment for broadcast, print, or outdoor ads.

Targeted advertising online may be easier to track, but, once again, that's difficult, or even impossible, for households that start out as disconnected and not online to receive them.

And lastly, these materials were translated into as many languages as possible. The FCC made great efforts in this area. And yet, advocates and others conducting outreach still often needed to rely on community members or other non-governmental parties for accurate translation.

Third, interviewees routinely noted that the EBB and ACP sign-up and verification processes were cumbersome for companies and Digital Navigators alike, despite their expertise; and that these processes could even be more bewildering for newly-eligible beneficiaries.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

The application process could be difficult and daunting to complete, especially for individuals told to apply online when they had no internet connection to start with.

Sign-up drives and community institutions, like libraries or other places that could help get people connected, would help to fill that gap, but they didn't resolve every challenge, such as applicants' difficulties finding their latitude and longitude coordinates on tribal lands.

Community leaders and ISPs serving impoverished areas noted that recipients could feel stigmatized and deterred from applying if they were embarrassed by answering questions posed by customer service representatives about their income and their enrollment in Medicaid and other benefits programs.

And all interviewees who expressed views on these topics certainly indicated appreciation for the speed with which programs had to be designed and rolled out, and for the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

safeguards and eligibility verification measures needed to ensure that such large amounts of funding were spent as intended. Yet, they all agreed on the need for streamlining and making these application processes better.

Fourth and finally, as I mentioned a moment ago, ISPs, governments, and community institutions participating in EBB and ACP had difficulties measuring sign-up and subscriber gains in real-time. While new subscriber numbers and churn rates are not the only measure needed to assess impact, policymakers would benefit from developing assessments and conducting a study of outreach effectiveness and other more holistic, quantitative, and qualitative determinations of different communities' responses to the availability of these support programs.

Individual ISPs may have relatively granular data on their own subscriber base, but they don't always share it publicly at that level of granularity, and they don't always share it in the same formats year over year between

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

different, and sometimes changing, service tiers or in ways that are readily comparable to other carriers' accounting metrics.

And finally, while the FCC's and the Universal Service Administrative Company's various dashboards and datasets have been tremendously helpful and a valuable measure of these programs' overall enrollment and expenditure totals, they can't always shed as much light on the successes or improvements needed to reach specific geographic areas and demographic groups with the outreach that we are talking about.

So, that's all I have buzzing quickly through all nine of those lessons, and I think I'm turning it back over to Dominique, but maybe straight to Clayton. Sorry to not have the run-of-show here remotely.

MEMBER HARRISON: Thank you so much to Chris, Dr. Ali, Anisa, and Matt for sharing all that great information.

I do want to point out, for those of

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

you who keep probably hearing the term "Opportunity Communities," that was developed by a Working Group on a prior Council as a way to describe the communities that we often talk about in terms of lacking of something or not, you know, being on the negative part of the spectrum -- unserved, underserved. And so, that Working Group coined the term "Opportunity Communities" to talk about the opportunities that we have with providing more access to those specific individuals.

So, at this moment, I do want to open it up for questions regarding the work of Workstream 2.

Go ahead, Steven.

MEMBER ROBERTS: And by the way, you guys did an outstanding job. I did read all of your stuff. I'm still awake from last night.

(Laughter.)

MEMBER ROBERTS: No, I'm just teasing. But, no, really, really outstanding.

So, as you heard from Jamila, you

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

know, obviously, the Chairwoman wants to continue with a new group. And my thought would be, where do we take your findings to the next level?

You heard some of us talk about in Congress you've got to give the tax to the people like me who's a broadcaster and people who want to go into communication. We've got to get some help from somewhere, access to capital. Where would you kind of see our next step, if we're still all around the room starting next month?

MEMBER HARRISON: Yes, I definitely want to open up the floor to our Workstream No. 2 members who presented this information, giving you all the platform to respond to Steven's question.

MEMBER GREEN: I think some of this work is already in tow, especially as we're looking at, hopefully, Congress refunding ACP or keeping some type of affordability program going and resolving that issue, hopefully, before the money runs out.

Is that on record? Yes, okay.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

(Laughter.)

MEMBER GREEN: And then I think some of the other recommendations, there's a lot of opportunity to expand upon and see how, in a practical sense, we can develop something in response to that. I think these are pie-in-the-sky concepts of what we think a world would look like if everyone were connected. And I think we heard that from our interviews. And these concepts need some practical application, and I'm hopeful that the next CEDC charter, even if I'm not in that seat, will take on and try to start putting some grassroots behind some of these concepts.

MEMBER HARRISON: Yes, and I just wanted to also, lastly, note, you know, I think there's a lot of great lessons to learn from all stakeholders across different kinds of industries. I mean, the fact that, you know, how do we make sure that some of the challenges that we went through during the pandemic don't happen, where you don't have children doing homework

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

outside of McDonald's in parking lots, like you don't have people who don't have access to internet or even a sign-up to get COVID shots.

So, there are a lot of great things that I think different federal agencies can take from this, as well as industry partners and other nonprofit organizations.

Are there any other comments?

Dr. Ali, I think your hand is up?

MEMBER ALI: Yes. Thanks so much.

I mean, I think the maybe one thing that we can take away as to what we heard is the doubling-down on the excitement, the fear, the possibility/opportunity of ACP. So, when this committee is returning, we're thinking through what are Workstreams really going to evaluate, and we're looking for specific qualitative evidence for the success of ACP.

If we need to marshal more evidence around why Congress needs to re-fund/reallocate for this program, maybe this is an opportunity for the CEDC and one of these Workstreams to take

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

our Workstream's research, and then, double-down in that particular area.

Because -- correct me if I'm wrong, anyone on the Workstream -- but I think every single person we spoke with talked about ACP, both about the possibilities that it brings to their communities; the concerns around how do we get the word out, and then, also, the larger, very much existential worry around the future of this program. So, I can very much see in the future a CEDC Workstream doubling-down on the issue of affordability through congressional programming.

MEMBER HARRISON: I see Dr. Gant's hand up.

MEMBER GANT: Yes, actually, Dr. Nicol Turner Lee actually brought this up earlier, and I just want to reemphasize this very important point: that we are in the horizon of the next generation of super-advanced technologies, as we're seeing with AI. I think one of the earlier groups talked about how quickly we've adopted

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

that.

And so, when we think about the digital divide, it's always binary "have or have not," but it's not really the world we live in. You know, we're really living in a world where our innovations are changing continuously. And as we advance, the amount of bandwidth that it takes, the amount of data that we're moving really goes up.

And then, how we define those divides or those places where folks are really hampered and get on are changing rapidly. So, I think it would be very important in the next charter to really explore other ways to really define some of these divides, and so forth.

I know the digital discrimination thing is a sticky issue, but you can move beyond that and say, how do we really make sure that the quality of the connections are really robust enough for people to have the experiences that are necessary with these emerging technologies, and so forth, and where are we getting new

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

divides, new places where it's not happening, and so forth?

And I think that model should include the speeds and the quality of the communication or the network, but also the complementary quality of the other services that are necessary to really help people have access to robust enough computers and really robustness enough kind of digital literacy training/digital navigation that really meets the changing needs that are happening as well, too.

So, that's what I would really encourage. You know, not necessarily getting the whole sticky issue around digital discrimination, but say, as we adopt more, how can we be more robust in understanding that? And surely have the voice of stakeholders in helping to define that and frame that.

MEMBER HARRISON: Thank you, Dr. Gant.

And then, Matt, did you want to say something?

MEMBER M. WOOD: Yes, just really

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

briefly. I wanted to note, in addition to all those great points, Anisa's point about the need to re-fund the ACP, which we certainly believe as well.

And Dr. Gant's point that the digital divide is not binary. You know, I would never be so callous as to look for a silver lining in COVID, but I do think these divides were with us before the pandemic; they were with us during the pandemic, and they're with us now. That experience illuminated them in new ways, but they were always there.

And the programs we're now putting in place, and in answer to the original question here, really were things we needed all along. So, I think we are building on a good base now. I think the challenge now is not to have the sense that, well, that was just for COVID; that was just for the emergency. Because, for many people, the emergency was ongoing long before the pandemic arrived.

And we have to not leave those people

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

behind now and get into this kind of thinking that was only temporary or that people don't really need this funding. Because it's not just about connecting subscribers; it's about keeping people connected and not getting into the rhetoric that says the program is only available if it's getting new people online without regard to the millions of people who couldn't afford to stay online without the support.

MEMBER HARRISON: Thank you so much, Matt.

And again, thank you so much to Workstream No. 2, and, Dr. Gant, thank you for presenting on Workstream No. 1.

We'll move to the next slide and hear from Workstream No. 3.

MEMBER BANKS: Hello, everyone. This is Clayton Banks. I think I'm the last Workstream something.

(Laughter.)

MEMBER BANKS: So, I am excited to make this very quick. Trust me, it's going to be

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

quick, and I agree with the unnecessary -- it's like we know who these people are, right?

(Laughter.)

MEMBER BANKS: So, Nicole, Susan, Heather, love you, guys. Thank you very much. Jamila Beth Johnson, everybody, you're all great people. All right?

So, I want to get right into it, though. This is really critical, right, to get us out of here?

(Laughter.)

MEMBER BANKS: So, Workstream 3, right, was all about public convening. And the first thing I would recommend is every one of you get a chance, go onto the FCC website, and look at the actual video. There's over a thousand people that have already watched it. So, not only yourselves, but anybody else that's doing this kind of stuff in their business, go onto that, because we've got some great conversation going on in those videos. So, I really do recommend that, and it's a lot easier to just see

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

that and hear what people are saying.

On my particular panel -- we had two panels -- on the particular panel that I was on, we had people that were representing states, representing different types of federal government. We had an ISP. We had community. So, you'll hear different voices on all that you've been hearing all today.

So, our objective, I think, at the end of the day was let's hear from all the voices. And what can we put behind that as good practices for what's going to happen with the FCC? What are those recommendations?

So, I'm going to continue to move on, and go on and talk about that ACP was a major, major conversation. Everyone talked about it, whether it's something that we needed to be extended or not. And most of the people had a real, I guess, thing that they thought about it, and depending on where they're coming from, ultimately, we all kind of thought ACP is good for now and more should already be put around it.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

So, again, you'll see exactly what each person talked about in that case.

Another thing that we looked at is how that ACP actually not only affects people in low income, but all over the place, whether it's tribal lands, whether it's -- you know, every location that you think is different than where everybody is getting in, like New York City. ACP is something that is going to be across the entire country like it is now. But we need that to be available to everyone. So, that is happening.

Now, the group all came together saying that was something that was necessary.

(Phone rings.)

MEMBER BANKS: I'm so sorry. See, they thought I was gone by now.

(Laughter.)

MEMBER BANKS: It's true, actually, but anyway -- so, one of the things that we also identified was with the nonprofit voice that was being also at this particular locale.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

PARTICIPANT: Next slide.

MEMBER BANKS: That would be nice. But what we're saying is that, in some of these locations where we can actually do things that's already been talked about -- working with libraries, talking about different community locations where wi-fi could be, you know, available as another way to give more people access -- a lot of us still believe that what we need to do is make sure it's going in the home for everyone. But, certainly, there was a lot of conversation about making sure it's available all throughout neighborhoods.

I think we also identified and talked about broadband adoption, along with affordability, and also, digital literacy. We all have talked about those three things all the time. So, skills training programs, we heard it from the ISPs how much they're investing in that, which is great to hear about with the broadband service providers and what the government is going, both federal and state, that are doing all

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

these things to give more and more people accessibility to the broadband, not just the wiring, but also how to use it; how to learn more about it, and obviously, get more people adopting it. So, that was, I think, a common conversation we kept having.

PARTICIPANT: Next slide.

MEMBER BANKS: Yes, if you don't mind.

So, if we get to that point where we're actually putting some great programs around literacy skills, training, and make it, obviously, nationally, like it's not just one location, but across the entire country, that's where the public and the private can come together and really figure out ways to do that across this Nation. It's something that we think will not be a good thing, but we can absolutely make it happen.

And then, there's always a conversation about funding. All right? So, whether it's who's going to get the funds; how those funds are going to be used, but that was

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

somewhat talked about in our particular panels. And I think that, at the end of the day, we talk about digital equity, right? So, we hear that term quite a bit. And we think digital equity also means funding. You've got to help people.

So, I'm going to sum up because I want it to be quick and I realize that we're trying to get kicked out by four o'clock. By the way, I've been kicked out of better places.

(Laughter.)

PARTICIPANT: Next slide.

MEMBER BANKS: But what I do know is it was very much a great conversation. I loved it, and I'm a real critical person about a lot of things when it comes to this particular issue. But it was I actually even liked the ISP guy.

So, it was just one of these things that I think, like I said, please watch the video. I can't tell you how good the people were responding; the recommendations that they made, that they had and shared with us. The video is very critical. I don't think anything else that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

has been shared, even today from my voice, represents what was really said on that video. It's really, really good.

All the recommendations. You'll hear a lot more of them in that video than from me or from any other thing that you may read.

So, that's it, Heather and Team. I just loved doing this for the last 25 years I've been doing it with you, and I hope to continue. But, for sure, we had a good time doing the Workstream 3. We didn't have the same stress that some of the other stuff had to do.

(Off-microphone question.)

MEMBER BANKS: No, no, it was Comcast on my panel. I'm sorry, my panel only. I know, you always want to challenge me on this. So, I get it. It get it. You have to shut them down sometimes. You know what I mean?

MEMBER HARRISON: Thank you, Clayton, so much for your presentation.

MEMBER BANKS: We're both New Yorkers. So, that's something else.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

(Laughter.)

MEMBER HARRISON: Really appreciate the work of Sarah-Kate Ellis and Vickie Robinson, who were also Co-Leads for Workstream 3, and all the other members that participated on Workstream 3's tasks.

I just wanted to emphasize that, you know, not only was it important for us to conduct the interviews and hear from the people, but we wanted to make it public by having the public convening. And so, what you'll also see in the report is that the recommendations are from the people, right? So, these are not things that we kind of developed on our own, but we wanted to push forward in advance what was on the hearts and minds of the people in the organizations that we spoke with.

So, I want to open it up for any questions in regards to the full report from Workstream No. 2 and 3 on the entirety of the work.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: Two questions.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

One, thank you to both of the groups for your tremendous presentations. Having supported some of the group in that first part of the charter, it's great to see how far we've come. As the old adage says, it's hard out of the gate, but it's easier when you get closer to the wind. So, thank you for that.

And thank you to Clayton. In all seriousness, I've known you for decades, and Clayton eats, lives, and breathes this stuff. So, it's actually really good to see how these projects were complementary.

My quick question (audio interference) for both of the groups, this is more of a comment than a question. You really gave some great feedback on the ACP in terms of some of the more pragmatic recommendations. So, again, as a committee in its final meeting, there have been three tranches. And I think we've talked about that. I've talked about it in terms of outreach money.

But I think these are some really

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

great recommendations for the organizations that are working in communities to be more sensitive to language and be more sensitive to the process.

So, if there's a way that we can also make sure the FCC gets these recommendations to their outreach partners? Because I think they've selected some really great partners, and this is just helpful information to improve upon what they're doing.

And then, the second thing I want to ask you, Clayton, because we've been in this space for a really long time. We've had a whole conversation around digital upskilling and we're still somewhat talking about digital literacy, despite the fact that technology has changed.

So, back in the days, digital literacy was, basically, a Microsoft Office class. And now, digital literacy could be a whole lot of things. And we heard today from other groups digital upskilling is really where we want to get people.

I just would like to hear if you heard

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

from some of the respondents about, quote-unquote, "digital literacy," as a frame of reference for people getting online? Or were they really also talking about digital upskilling?

MEMBER BANKS: Well, I have my personal way of saying it, but I'm going to keep that to myself because I'll be kicked out of here.

But one of the ISPs talked about what they're doing across the Nation, creating these learning lessons of their own, and literally, sitting down with curriculum and giving people access to it at schools, at senior citizen locations, and all this.

It was, particularly, Comcast that was talking about that. And they are very committed to it, investing in it, and the idea to get people to, obviously, do adoption to internet.

I think that every ISP is thinking of that or figuring out how to get more and more access for people. I always talk about, you

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

know, if you don't have the internet, you don't even have a computer. Because why have a computer if you don't have the internet?

So, the other piece of this is, where are the devices? Is that affordable? And so, I think what some of the ISPs are doing, they are really focused on how to get the pieces that they need to actually even become a subscriber.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: So, thank you for that. And we can take that offline.

MEMBER BANKS: We should. We should. I can tell you what I really feel.

(Laughter.)

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: I know what you think. But I do think that's a start, particularly for communities that --

MEMBER BANKS: It is.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: -- don't have a bridge into this ecosystem.

But it's interesting, with the emergence of the new technologies, how we start thinking about this concept of digital literacy.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

And so, it becomes much more generative for individuals that are in this space versus something that's potentially static.

Well, I'll stop there for the sake of time.

MEMBER BANKS: No, I appreciate it.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: Thank you.

MEMBER BANKS: I appreciate it. My only question is, who taught you? Okay, let's go on.

MEMBER HARRISON: Any other questions for Workstream 3 or about the larger report?

(No response.)

MEMBER HARRISON: All right. Thank you so much.

I, again, just want to really thank all of the members of the Digital Empowerment and Inclusion Working Group. It has been a pleasure working with you all. Thank you for bringing your expertise, your dedication, and your time. Thank you for stepping up when others didn't. Thank you for writing. Thank you for reading,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

spell-checking, all of that. I really appreciate working alongside of each of you.

So, I will turn it over to Heather.

(Applause.)

CHAIR GATE: I'd like to thank you, Dr. Harrison and the Digital Empower and Inclusion Working Group. You all carried the CEDC the first year. You took that heavy load and you did a lot of work.

So, I'm eternally grateful for everybody's contribution to the report that we submitted in November. For me, it was unprecedented for us to submit that type of report in a few months. So, thank you for accepting the challenge and still continuing to work after that. I really appreciated that.

And also, all that digital equity, that's my passion. So, I'm not going to get started because we would need an hour.

So, at this point, I would like to ask you if you would like to submit your report.

MEMBER HARRISON: Yes, I would like to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

submit the report for adoption by the CEDC.

CHAIR GATE: Do I have a second?

(Off-microphone comments.)

Oh, golly, that's a lot of seconds.

Okay. And I will combine, given that the two Working Groups worked on -- they used different strategies to address the same topic. So, I will submit that.

So, recommendations for advancing digital equity in the provision of broadband service is submitted by public convening Workstream 3, and also, Workstream 2 that did the listening for it, of the Digital Equity and Inclusion Working Group.

So, below are recommendations from the March 23rd, 2022 public convenings. We would like to submit those recommendations for adoption.

And at this point, I would like to seek unanimous consent.

Anyone who has any objections or would like to abstain, please speak.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Anyone online?

All right. No one online.

Okay, we're all clear. And so, the recommendations are adopted in the reports. And thank you very much.

(Applause.)

CHAIR GATE: Okay. And now, we've moved to the closing.

I'll keep it brief. I think lesson learned from Anisa, I think I've thanked everybody profusely at the beginning and I won't repeat. If I forgot, I will find you and thank you.

I do want to recognize and thank one other stakeholder group, and it's all the people that showed up to talk to us. They committed their time.

As Susan and I and Dr. Turner internally have talked about, this work is about the people and for the people. At the end of the day, that's what matters, why we do what we do.

But I do want to remind everybody that

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

this not the time for us to take our foot off the pedal, right? There's still work to be done.

The next CEDC has been rechartered. I trust that most of you will submit, if not all of you, will resubmit your nomination. Yes, I understand it does entail a time commitment, but it is time in our Nation, it's a critical time for us to be here to roll up our sleeves and pick up where we left off and continue.

Remember, during the period of this next charter, funding will start flowing into the communities. So, it is absolutely critical for the CEDC to continue to engage and to pick up the recommendations that we discussed today.

Secondly, and lastly -- and then, I will stop talking -- secondly, I want to make sure that the next CEDC is fully committed, as you were, and goes above and beyond to move the needle, as the money will be out there in the communities.

So, in addition to you all trying to request nomination, make sure that those

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

stakeholders that we engaged that may need a seat at this table submit themselves as well. It is not just for us to talk to them. It is for us to encourage them to participate and be part of this Commission.

But they must be prepared to work. Okay? They must be prepared to work. They must understand that this is a commitment. They must understand that we must continue to be productive.

And lastly, as my fellow Co-Chairs talked about, we want to make sure that the FCC understands our intention to ensure that this information is transmitted to those other agencies, so that they can listen and be effective in implementing their projects.

So, thank you. It's so nice to meet a lot of you today.

And I'll give the floor to Dr. Turner.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: Yes, and I'll be brief. I said what I wanted to say earlier.

And I want to reiterate again

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

gratitude. I know that we've said thank you to everybody, but there are many people in this room who are never recognized for their hard work. And so, it's always helpful to say another thank you in gratitude, because we often don't get that. And we do a lot of this work, and we wake up often exhausted. And so, again, thank you. If it means anything to anyone again, we're going to keep saying it until you know that we mean it.

I just want to end it like this. This is a big committee. You know, 80 people is no joke. And it is clear that in these last few hours that we have been together, that despite the struggles and the trials and the tribulations, and the laughter, and other things, the results speak to the kind of work that was done within your committees.

And hopefully, as we go forward, and if you decide to sign up again, you now know what you're getting into. It's no secret the level of dedication that comes with this particular committee.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

And the last thing I will just say is, it is clear that, despite all the efforts that we have done, that we have so much more work to do.

When I first started in this space, I was like the girl at the prom. Nobody wanted to dance with me. And I was doing digital divide work three-four decades ago, whatever, with Clayton.

CHAIR GATE: Two.

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: Oh, two? I was trying not to age you, girlfriend. I was doing like a three, but I wasn't trying to age you. Now, we weren't 10, Heather, when we started this.

(Laughter.)

VICE CHAIR TURNER LEE: But my point is, this committee as the central intelligence and the validation point for this work is important, because there are a lot of people talking about the digital divide and not many people who can reflect a lived experience of those who are on the other side of digital

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

opportunity. So, I say that, for one.

But I also implore the FCC to think about that, since everybody is talking about it, there needs to be more people who are sitting at this table on the other committees as well. When it comes to consumer advisory, when it comes to technical assistance, when it comes to other committees at the FCC, let's make sure that we're sprinkled with diversity throughout. So that the issues that we're dealing with are not always concentrated, but, rather, they're shared.

And so, I would just put that out as just one of the things I thought about, as we were wrapping up. Like we could have been here another two hours, but, really, we need this to be whatever we're talking about, whether it's technical assistance, whether it's in the consumer advisory, whether it's on whatever committee the FCC has, that we also make diversity a significant quotient there as well.

So, great working with everybody and thank you again.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Susan? Now, I left you four minutes.
But Jamila's still got to talk.

(Laughter.)

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: Can I speak for
you?

(Laughter.)

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: Well, it's been
an honor to serve this Council as the Vice Chair.
I'm the rose between the two thorns.

(Laughter.)

VICE CHAIR AU ALLEN: They just
energized me and instilled in me and challenged
me to think differently. And together with all
of you, it has been an honor to be a Vice Chair
in the last two years.

I have listened. I have observed.
I've learned from you. My lens has a wider angle
and I am enriched because of this relationship
and this working two years.

At the top of the event this morning,
I was a little flustered when I was moved around
a little bit, like a FOB in the ocean. And

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

finally, I got to speak, and then, I forgot to thank all the people who have made this possible -- starting from across the Chairwoman. I thanked her, but, Jamila, I forgot about you, and Diana, and all those who worked with you within the FCC. Without you, the steady hand that guided us -- actually, over the last two years, you have always done that in the six years I've served under your tutelage. Thank you very much.

Finally, to follow up on what Heather said, last night we talked about this all about people. Eighty-some people -- hard to manage, and you did it. We just followed you.

I want to quote from a Chinese proverb, and that is, they say that, if you want to grow one year of prosperity, you grow grain. If you want to grow 10 years of prosperity, you grow trees. If you want to grow 100 years of prosperity, you grow people. That's what we want to do here.

Thank you very much.

(Applause.)

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Well, thank you, ladies, so much.

And before I take the DFO's point of privilege to thank even more people, I'd like to turn to my colleague, Diana, to see if she has some closing remarks.

Diana?

MS. COHO: Thank you, Jamila, and Heather, Susan, Nicol, everyone, all the Work Group Chairs and everyone.

I came to try to help out, and I can't tell you how much I learned and how much I grew, you know, as a person, as an FCC employee, and just as a comrade-in-arms for diversity, inclusion, equity, empowerment. You name it.

So, I thank you all, you know, on behalf, obviously, of the Commission, but, also, personally. You were so wonderful and so welcoming when I sort of was asked to jump in, and there were so many monumental tasks, kind of one after the other, with all the events that were being planned, and then, all the report

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

writing, and the presentations.

And everyone is just so respectful, so knowledgeable, and so great to work with because you advocate for your causes. You sometimes have differing viewpoints, but you always keep that big picture in mind, and how can we serve the most, the best, and best honesty and so much integrity.

So, again, thank you, and I just can't believe that I was privileged to be part of this.

And like I said before, if there's anything else I can do, please let me know. And travel safely to your homes.

And this is really a life-changing experience, and it's not going to end here today, but, you know, this is a chapter and there's a new charter beginning. So, thank you for the opportunity.

MS. BESS JOHNSON: Well, thank you, Diana.

Well, we have reached a milestone today, truly, in the completion of our two-year

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

charter of the CEDC. And I offer my sincere congratulations to each of you for this impressive body of work. It's been an extremely satisfying journey with some long-term friends and some new friends. And I hope we can keep the collaboration going.

I'm a firm believer that you cannot say thank you enough for a job well done. So, in that vein, I would like to thank all of the members of the CEDC, including those who had to discontinue their active participation due to conflicting family obligations. Your work is valued and appreciated.

Thank you to each of the Workstream Leads, for each of the Working Group teams. And that would be -- I want to call names -- Anna Gomez, C. Howie Hodges II, Matthew Bauer, Rosa Mendoza, Antonio Tijerino, Aama Nahuja, Charlyn Stanberry, Melody Spann Cooper, Ellen Schned, Skip Dillard, Dr. Christopher Ali, Chris James, Vickie Robinson, Clayton Banks, Sarah-Kate Ellis, Dr. Jon Gant, and Joi Chaney.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Of course, an incredible amount of time and effort was expended by our impressive Working Group Chairs by identifying a clear, achievable mission and objectives; keeping a robust meeting schedule; identifying subject matter experts for your respective teams to meet with and learn from; for drafting parts of these reports and recommendations; for developing the presentations for our meetings, and for keeping your teams on task and on time. You have our deepest gratitude and respect.

I want to extend my personal appreciation to the leader I have worked most closely with over this charter, and that is Heather Gate. Heather, for those of you who do not know her well, is a very dedicated professional who cares deeply about the issues the CEDC examines.

Heather has given more personal hours than I can even count -- to attend meetings; help with drafting and editing; to offer suggestions; to pinpoint the efforts of the Working Groups,

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

and generally, sweating the small stuff. There must always be a leader who will sweat the small stuff because that is what makes the overall committee so effective.

Heather, it's been a pleasure and honor to serve with you, and I thank you so very much.

To our Vice Chairs, Dr. Nicol Turner Lee and Susan Au Allen, you have brought a necessary urgency of now to the efforts of the CEDC. We couldn't imagine having done this work without you. You both have your fingers on the pulse of the digital ecosystem and how underrepresented constituencies must engage and have their concerns represented in these courageous conversations.

Thank you both for reading all the reports; drafting some of the reports; editing the reports; providing the critical food for thought that helped to direct and mold the way the Workstream groups organized their thinking and their programs. I know that each of the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

Working Groups truly appreciated your guidance.

Thank you, also, to the several FCC colleagues who were terrific that I had the privilege to work alongside from the beginning: Rashann Duvall and Keyla Hernandez-Ulloa, two terrific public servants who took this work very seriously. Thank you.

Thank you, also, to the fabulous Aurelie Mathieu, who came onboard for about 12 months and brought so much value to this work. Thank you, Aurelie.

And now, Ashley Tyson, who has done a great job, even though she's only been with us for a few months.

And the very wise and capable Diana Coho, who has really rolled up her sleeves to learn about the advisory committee process. She's a super partner.

Today's meeting could not have happened without the support of our hardworking FCC staff: Jeff Riordan, Steve Balderson, Greg Huff of the Commission Meeting Room Team. You

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

all are truly the best partners for our meetings and all of our advisory committee activities.

Thank you, also, to our colleagues throughout the FCC who made today's meeting a success: Vanessa Lemme, Brenda Lewis, Steve Curtis, Brittany Gomes, Anthony Davis, Kimberly Jackson, Greg Kwan, Sherry Dawson, and Michael Richards.

Lastly, my appreciation to FCC Chairwoman Jessica Rosenworcel, Commissioner Brendan Carr, Commissioner Geoffrey Starks, and Commissioner Nathan Simington for their unwavering support of the CEDC.

Also, my thanks to my supervisors: Holly Sauer, Hillary DeNigro, and Radhika Karmarkar.

If I have forgotten to mention anyone's name who offered support, please forgive me.

To the broader public, I hope you have found value in the many workshops and public programs of this advisory committee and that you

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

will continue to participate with us.

Today's adopted reports will be posted soon to the CEDC's web page on the FCC's website.

And with that, we hope everyone has a wonderful summer. Take care. God bless you, and I'll see you soon.

(Applause.)

CHAIR GATE: And on that note, this meeting is adjourned, and thank you very much.

(Applause.)

(Whereupon, the above-entitled matter went off the record at 4:06 p.m.)

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309